



Human Rights Council
Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review
Forty-first session
7–18 November 2022

Summary of Stakeholders' submissions on Bahrain*

Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights

I. Background

1. The present report was prepared pursuant to Human Rights Council resolutions 5/1 and 16/21, taking into consideration the periodicity of the universal periodic review. It is a summary of 40 stakeholders' submissions¹ for the universal periodic review, presented in a summarized manner owing to word-limit constraints. The report has been prepared taking into consideration the outcome of the previous review.²

II. Information provided by stakeholders

A. Scope of international obligations³ and cooperation with human rights mechanisms

2. MAAT recommended Bahrain to consider joining international conventions to which it is not yet a party.⁴ JS9 recommended that Bahrain ratify OP-ICCPR-1⁵. MAAT and JS9 recommended ratifying OP-ICCPR-2.⁶ MAAT recommended to study accession to the OP-ICESCR.⁷ Several submissions recommended Bahrain to ratify the OP-CEDAW.⁸ NIHR and several submissions recommended ratifying the OP-CAT.⁹ NIHR, JS6 and JS12 recommended ratifying the ICPED.¹⁰ MR and NIHR recommended ratifying ICRMWF.¹¹

3. JS3 noted that Bahrain continued to maintain its reservations to Articles 3, 9(5), 14(7), 18, and 23 of ICCPR and recommended lifting the reservation made on Article 3.¹² MAAT noted the need to consider retracting the reservations to CEDAW.¹³ Several submissions recommended lifting all reservations made on Articles 2, 9(2), 15(4), 16 and 29(1) of CEDAW.¹⁴ NIHR, JS12 and JS13 recommended withdrawing the reservation on Article 9(2) of CEDAW.¹⁵

4. HRW and JS4 and noted that since 2007, the government has not allowed a single Special Procedures to visit the country¹⁶ and JS4 observed that the government has cancelled a visit from the High Commissioner for Human Rights.¹⁷ Several submissions recommended accepting previously issued requests from the Special Procedures for country visits, including the Special Rapporteurs on freedom of opinion and expression¹⁸, freedom of peaceful assembly and association¹⁹, and torture²⁰ and issue a standing invitation to all mandate

* The present document is being issued without formal editing.



holders²¹. MAAT recommended to allow them to conduct field visits to places of detention inside the country.²² JS12 recommended that Bahrain respond to the reminders for country visits sent by the Working Group on Enforced and Involuntary Disappearance.²³

5. HRW and ICSRF recommended ratifying the Rome Statute to the International Criminal Court (ICC).²⁴ MR and JS1 recommended ratifying and implementing the 2014 protocol to the Forced Labour Convention of the International Labour Organization (ILO)²⁵. JS6 and JS14 recommended to ratify ILO Conventions No. (87) and (98).²⁶ MAAT and JS13 recommended ratifying the 1954 and 1961 Statelessness Conventions.²⁷ MAAT recommended to consider the ratification of the Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and its 1967 Protocol.²⁸ ICAN calls upon Bahrain to sign, ratify or accede to the TPNW.²⁹

6. NIHR urged Bahrain to submit its initial or periodic reports to the treaty bodies on time, without delay, and on a regular and periodic basis.³⁰

7. In 2019, Bahrain submitted its midterm report regarding the implementation of the recommendations made during the third cycle of the UPR in 2017.³¹ ICSRF noted that Bahrain did not implement a large number of recommendations on rights and freedoms.³²

B. National human rights framework

1. Constitutional and legislative framework

8. ICSRF noted that the Constitution neither refers to the supremacy of international agreements over domestic laws nor gives them the legal value of the legislation. It recommended issuance of a decree that provides the supremacy of international treaties and its implementation.³³ BHRWS recommended revising legislation and removing all articles that are inconsistent with the constitution and ratified international treaties.³⁴

2. Institutional infrastructure and policy measures

9. JS11 noted that Bahrain failed to implement the 3rd cycle recommendations to strengthen the independence and effectiveness of the NIHR.³⁵ NIHR noted that 2006 Decree-Law No.(20) was issued amending some provisions of the law establishing the NIHR, taking into account the observations and recommendations made by GANHRI and its Sub-Committee. It noted that this Decree enhanced the transparency of consultations and appointments of the Council of Commissioners.³⁶ JS5 and JS12 recommended that Bahrain establish a clear mechanism for the selection process of the NIHR Council of Commissioners.³⁷ JS12 recommended ensuring the independence of the NIHR and guarantee compliance with the principles relating to the status of national institutions for the promotion and protection of human rights.³⁸

10. Several submissions recommended ensuring the independence of the Office of the Ombudsman at the Ministry of the Interior.³⁹

C. Promotion and protection of human rights

1. Implementation of international human rights obligations, taking into account applicable international humanitarian law

Equality and non-discrimination

11. JS14 noted that Bahrain supported recommendation 114.63, regarding combating intolerance and discrimination.⁴⁰ HRW and NIHR noted that in 2018, Bahrain amended its labor law to ban discrimination based on sex, origin, language or creed, and sexual harassment in the workplace.⁴¹ NIHR commended that 2021 Decree-Law No. (16) includes the addition of explicit text that states: “It is prohibited to discriminate in wages between men and women workers for work of equal value”.⁴² HRW regretted that the labor law does not refer to sexual orientation, gender identity, disability, or age and recommended prohibiting discrimination on such basis.⁴³

12. Several recommendations regretted that despite representing the majority of the population, Bahrain's Shia Muslim community has long suffered discrimination and appears grossly underrepresented in governmental, administrative and police/army jobs.⁴⁴ JS7 recommended ensuring that discrimination in the recruitment process is ameliorated, and especially discrimination against Shi'a in the public sector.⁴⁵ UNDUPRC and JS12 noted that since the Covid-19 pandemic, precautionary measures have been used disproportionately to target Shia Muslim worshippers during Muharram and Ashura.⁴⁶ ADF and JS12 recommended ensuring the equal rights of all persons to freedom of religion, including ending targeted discrimination, arbitrary arrests and deprivation of citizenship of Shia Muslims.⁴⁷ ADF recommended to redouble efforts to promote interreligious dialogue, sectarian reconciliation and peaceful coexistence.⁴⁸

Right to life, liberty and security of person, and freedom from torture

13. JS9 regretted that death penalty remains, often during unfair trials, for terrorism-related offences (No. 58/2006) and for non-lethal offences like drugs offences (Law 15/2007).⁴⁹ MAAT noted an increase in the number of death sentences, with 51 in 2021.⁵⁰ BHRS noted that there is a list of 16 death row prisoners awaiting the King's ratification of the sentences to be executed, appealing to the king not to ratify this list.⁵¹ HRW and JS9 noted that Bahrain has executed six men since it ended the moratorium in 2017.⁵² NIHR and several submissions recommended reinstating a moratorium on death sentences and executions.⁵³ ICSRF recommended Bahrain to abolish the death penalty utterly and replacing it with other punishment.⁵⁴ While JS9 recommended revising legislation where the death penalty can be applied to ensure that it complies with the 'most serious crimes' under international law.⁵⁵ NIHR stresses the importance of enabling people facing the death penalty to exercise their right to request a pardon or commutation by ensuring that clemency procedure shall be fair and transparent.⁵⁶

14. JS4 and JS12 noted that cases of enforced disappearance had been recorded.⁵⁷ ICSRF regretted that there is no law that protects or solves cases of forced disappearance.⁵⁸

15. AF and JS11 noted that the King issued Royal Decree No. 56 amending the Penal Code, attempting to bring the definition of torture further in line with CAT.⁵⁹ AF noted that the new wording does not provide protections for those who have been tortured outside of detention and that the amendment removed the six-month minimum sentence.⁶⁰ AF recommended amending the Penal Code to comply with the CAT obligations.⁶¹

16. JS4 noted that since 2017, there have been 108 documented cases of torture, ill-treatment, and denial of medical treatment in detention facilities, particularly between June and July 2018.⁶² JS2, JS10, JS12 and JS7 noted a trend of arbitrary arrest and ill-treatment of minors are not granted a fair trial, and recommended providing them with free legal aid, investigations and holding perpetrators accountable.⁶³ JS12 recommended applying alternatives to deprivation of liberty, to meet the best interests of the child, in accordance with the CRC,⁶⁴ while JS7 recommended ending the practice of incarcerating those under 18 and providing detained children with education.⁶⁵ Several submissions noted that authorities failed to credibly investigate and prosecute officials and police officers who allegedly committed serious violations, including torture.⁶⁶ BFHR noted the extrajudicial killings of five citizens after storming the peaceful assembly square in Diraz.⁶⁷ Seven submissions recommended ensuring that perpetrators of torture are held accountable.⁶⁸

17. MAAT, JS9, and JS11 recommended ensuring that victims of torture and ill-treatment are provided with access to redress, rehabilitation and compensation.⁶⁹ HRC and JS5 recommended that Bahrain establish an independent and effective national preventive mechanism⁷⁰ and JS9 recommended the establishment of an independent and impartial commission of inquiry.⁷¹ Several submissions recommended ensuring the independence and effectiveness of the Prisoners and Detainees Rights Commission by converting it into the National Preventive Mechanism in line with OP-CAT.⁷² Several submissions recommended ensuring the independence of the Special Investigation Unit from the Public Prosecution Office.⁷³ JS9 recommended ensuring that the judiciary is sufficiently trained to discharge its duty to investigate allegations of torture and ill-treatment.⁷⁴ Several submissions recommended ensuring that confessions and statements obtained through torture or ill-treatment are inadmissible in court and that all prison sentences on this basis are commuted.⁷⁵

18. Several submissions observed that authorities continue to deny Bahraini prisoners adequate medical care⁷⁶, including imprisoned minors.⁷⁷ Several submissions recommended that Bahrain comply with international standards regarding prisoner treatment and provide medical care to prisoners.⁷⁸ JS7 recommended ending overcrowding in Jau Central Prison.⁷⁹ AF, MAAT and JS6 recommended upholding the right of the accused to access family and legal counsel,⁸⁰ including for imprisoned minors.⁸¹ HRW, ICSRF and JS12 recommended allowing human rights group to visit Bahraini prisons.⁸²

Human rights and counter-terrorism

19. Several submissions noted the denaturalizing of 238 Bahrainis in 2018, and noted that the Citizenship Act was amended in 2019 to specifically include terror-related offences as grounds for revocation of citizenship, providing the executive authority the discretion to use it as a political weapon to hammer mass anti-government protests.⁸³ JS10 and JS5 recommended amending anti-terrorism laws, namely the definition of terrorism within.⁸⁴ JS5 recommended Bahrain to continue reinstating the nationalities.⁸⁵ NIHR supported the amendment of some provisions of the Citizenship Law by Decree-Law No. (16) 2019, by repealing Article (24 bis) of Law No. (58) 2006 regarding the protection of society from terrorist acts, which provides for cancelling the revocation of Bahraini citizenship in the event of being convicted of some of the crimes stipulated in the same law.⁸⁶

20. JS12 recommended establishing safeguards to ensure that rights of fair trial and due process are respected in the application of the Counter-Terrorism Law and that the law is not used to target human rights defenders, activists or members of the opposition.⁸⁷

Administration of justice, including impunity, and the rule of law

21. KRC noted that Bahraini courts issue judgments against many activists, politicians and protesters without regard to prior rights and guarantees, and by employing articles and texts from the Penal Code and the Law to Protect Society from Terrorist Acts, by adapting these laws in an unequal way.⁸⁸ BHRS and KRC observed that the judiciary, in many cases, issued heavy sentences against many defendants, especially those with a political background and related to freedom of opinion and expression, in the absence of physical evidence of the crime and based on confessions.⁸⁹

22. Several submissions noted since Bahrain's 3rd UPR Cycle, there have been ongoing escalation against religious and cultural figures, political dissidents, and peaceful activists observed through several unfair mass trials.⁹⁰ BFHR reported on the arbitrary rulings issued after the trial of 171 Bahraini citizens for their participation in the peaceful assembly in front of the house of Ayatollah Sheikh Isa Qassem, based on false investigations, confessions extracted under torture, and invalid arrest procedures.⁹¹ JS5 recommended ensuring redress for human rights violations victims and an end to the "culture of impunity".⁹² ICSRF also observed that there is no articles in the law on compensation for those who are wrongly sentenced and for the verdict to be nullified due to a judicial error.⁹³ ICSRF and JS12 recommended passing a legal text that allows detainees and the accused, whose freedom were restricted for no legal reason, to claim compensation.⁹⁴

23. BTS observed that according to Corruption Perception Index for 2021 Bahrain was ranked as 78 with score of 42/100. BTS noted that Bahrain amended its legislation and issued new legislations in accordance with its obligation to the UN Convention Against Corruption, but it is still short of fulfilling its obligations under this convention.⁹⁵ BTS and BHRWS recommended amending its legislation to comply with these obligations and combat corruption.⁹⁶ BTS recommended establishing a National Commission on Anti-corruption.⁹⁷

Fundamental freedoms and the right to participate in public and political life

24. ECLJ and ADF noted that Bahrain made efforts to promote religious diversity and inclusiveness.⁹⁸ ADF and JS12 regretted that Article 23 of the Constitution restricts freedom of expression when it infringes upon the "fundamental beliefs of Islamic doctrine", threatens "the unity of the people", or provokes "discord or sectarianism".⁹⁹ ADF and ADHRB noted that these grounds are overly broad and subjective, opening the door to the arbitrary and unjustified restrictions.¹⁰⁰ ADF recommended amending it to ensure its compatibility with

freedom of expression.¹⁰¹ ECLJ recommended that Bahrain remove the reliance on Sharia law from its Constitution and shift its legal system so that it can administer impartial judgment on all of its citizens.¹⁰² BFHR recommended prohibiting "any advocacy of national, racial or religious hatred that constitutes incitement to discrimination, hostility or violence".¹⁰³ BHRWS recommended strengthening tolerance and coexistence speech against the speeches of extremism, hatred and sectarianism.¹⁰⁴

25. ECLJ, JS12 and ADF observed that Bahrain has also codified blasphemy laws which can be used to target individuals because of their religious beliefs.¹⁰⁵ ADF recommended repealing Articles 309 and 310 of the Penal Code criminalizing blasphemy.¹⁰⁶

26. MAAT noted that several recommendations called on Bahrain to promote the right to freedom of opinion and expression and the right to peaceful assembly and association.¹⁰⁷ NCF noted that Bahrain is currently ranked 168 out of 180 countries on the World Press Freedom Index.¹⁰⁸ Several submissions noted that article 169 of the Penal Code penalizes any publication authorities consider to be untrue, undermining of public peace or State creditworthiness, insulting the king or the national flag or emblem. They noted that the government has put the exercise of rights under greater threat, by introducing and amendment different laws to be vague, such as penal, Anti-terror, Press and Publication and the Cybercrime.¹⁰⁹ JS4 observed that the government amended in 2019 the Press and Media Law of 2002 to introduce the harmful concept of social media misuse and tougher penalties in case of its breach, which include anything the government considers "to threaten community peace, cause division, and weaken national unity."¹¹⁰ JS10 recommended repealing or amending laws that restrict the freedoms of expression, association or assembly, including decree No. 31 of 2013, Law No. 34 of 2014, and Law No. 26 of 2015.¹¹¹ ADHRB and JS10 recommended to amend aspect of the Penal Code that threaten the transparency of journalists to report on events freely.¹¹²

27. BHRS, BTS and JS1 noted that Law No. 21/1989 imposes strict restrictions on the establishment and financing of civil society organizations (CSOs), and places CSOs under the supervision and oversight of the concerned ministry. They recommended repealing Law 21/1989 and issuing a new law for CSOs or radically amending the current one to comply with the Constitution.¹¹³ NIHR called for issuing a new law for civil organizations and institutions, taking into consideration the appropriate developments in human rights, while strengthening the guarantees that ensure the exercise of the right to organize in accordance with the relevant UN conventions. It hoped speeding up the amendment of the current law, which prohibits the participation of some citizens in the membership of the boards of directors of civil societies being members of dissolved political parties.¹¹⁴

28. JS12 noted that Bahrain supported four recommendations to ensure protection of human rights defenders, including the adoption of a law to protect human rights defenders that provides special protection for vulnerable groups. JS12 regretted a systematic crackdown on women Human Rights defenders, who were arrested and detained.¹¹⁵ Several submissions recommended that Bahrain immediately release all opposition activists, journalists, and other individuals arrested solely for exercising their right to free speech, peaceful assemble, or association.¹¹⁶ HRW recommended allowing foreign journalists and human rights organizations access to Bahrain.¹¹⁷

29. Several submissions noted that in 2021, the Cabinet approved amendments to the 2002 Press, Printing, and Publishing Law to expand its jurisdiction to internet content.¹¹⁸ Several submissions noted that the law requires that electronic media outlets obtain approval from the Ministry of Information Affairs.¹¹⁹ HRW, MAAT and ODVV noted that between June 2020 and May 2021, at least 58 people were arrested, detained, or prosecuted for their online activities.¹²⁰ HRW recommended amending the press law to comply with Article 19 ICCPR.¹²¹ JS15 also recommended ceasing the use of Cyber Law and the Penal Code to prosecute internet users.¹²² ADHRB regretted that the Telecommunications Regulatory Authority (TRA) extensively monitors and censors content on the internet.¹²³ ADHRB recommended to curb the powers of the TRA and the Ministry of Information Affairs to allow for a more open space for the media.¹²⁴

30. Several stakeholders regretted that the Article (3) of the Law on the Exercise of Political Rights was amended and stipulated the refusal of candidacy for the House of

Representatives for anyone who had been convicted of a criminal offence.¹²⁵ BHRS observed that with this change, the re-election of members of dissolved political societies has been prevented.¹²⁶ Based on the above amendments, several submissions noted that the Ministry of Labor and Social Development considered citizens who belonged to the dissolved political societies do not enjoy full civil and political rights, thus not eligible for candidacy to societies and clubs.¹²⁷ Several submissions recommended repealing the amendment under Law No. 25/2018.¹²⁸ NCF recommended that Bahrain overturn its decision to dissolve its major opposition political societies.¹²⁹ BHRS and JS4 noted that Law No. 32/2006 regarding assembly and demonstration severely restricts the freedom of assemblies and marches.¹³⁰ JS12 noted that this law requires organizers to seek out authorization from the Ministry of Interior for public demonstrations, thereby criminalizing demonstrations which do not receive approval.¹³¹ BHRS recommended amending laws to enhance the right of peaceful assembly and peaceful marches, and adopting the principle of notification to organize assemblies and marches.¹³²

31. BHRS observed that law No. 26/2005 on political societies sets strict conditions for the licensing and operation of political societies. BHRS recommended that this law be abolished and that the formation of any political party or association be subject to the will of the founders, and that the judiciary be the reference on any lawsuits against political organizations.¹³³ Salam DHR and JS7 recommended that the government launch a comprehensive national dialogue that contributes to resolving contentious points with the political opposition, to ensure an end to all violations at the political and human rights levels.¹³⁴ JS10 also recommended to take urgent steps to facilitate the work of civil society and human rights defenders and guarantee the protection of all persons from intimidation or reprisals for seeking to cooperate with the United Nations.¹³⁵

32. JS1, JS12 and JS3 observed low participation of women in the Council of Representatives and the Shura Council.¹³⁶ JS1 recommended adopting a quota to increase women's participation in political life at all levels.¹³⁷

Right to privacy

33. HRW noted that in July 2021, Bahrain, already believed to be a customer of the NSO Group's Pegasus spyware, and reportedly had entered phone numbers of potential targets into a database, which was leaked.¹³⁸ Several submissions noted that in August 2021, Citizen Lab reported that the iPhones of nine Bahraini activists were successfully hacked with NSO Group's Pegasus spyware between June 2020 and February 2021.¹³⁹ JS15 and JS12 recommended that Bahrain cease the surveillance operations and hacking of Bahraini activist and human rights defenders.¹⁴⁰ HRW recommended to impose a moratorium on the use of surveillance technology until adequate human rights safeguards are in place and disclose any existing contracts or use of such technologies.¹⁴¹

Right to marriage and family life

34. JS3 and JS12 noted that despite the guarantee of equality in Article 18 of the Constitution, the Family Law provides for a marital framework based on complementary rights, not equal rights, between the two spouses whereby in return for maintenance and protection from her husband, a wife is expected to obey him and care for the household.¹⁴² JS4 noted that despite amending the Family Law in 2017, it still discriminates against women's right to marry someone of choice, to divorce or even extend citizenship to her child.¹⁴³ JS1, JS3, UNDUPRC and JS4 noted that under this law the man's right to divorce is absolute and effective immediately while the woman's right to divorce is limited.¹⁴⁴ JS12 recommended reforming and unifying the family law to ensure equality and eliminate any form of discrimination against women in law and practice (for Sunni and Shia communities).¹⁴⁵

35. ECLJ noted that the use of Sharia law is extremely problematic and inherently discriminatory against non-Muslims especially in family matters. ECLJ stated that sharia law is discriminatory towards women as Muslim men are freely allowed to marry non-Muslim women, so long as the women belong to a monotheist religion, whereas Muslim women are expressly prohibited from marrying non-Muslim men.¹⁴⁶

Prohibition of all forms of slavery, including trafficking in persons

36. JS1 noted that female domestic workers are exposed to practices that are considered indicators of forced labor, such as non-payment of salary, withholding of personal documents, excessive overtime, isolation and physical and psychological violence.¹⁴⁷ MR noted that Bahrain treats indicators of forced labour as civil or labour law violations rather than investigating them as potential trafficking crimes.¹⁴⁸ MR recommended to prosecute indicators of forced labour under the trafficking law and to provide open shelters for victims of trafficking and forced labour.¹⁴⁹ JS1 recommended providing the mandatory inclusion of domestic workers under the Wages Protection System linked to the Ministry of Labor, to ensure that the wage payment process is monitored; and to enact legislation to protect non-resident female domestic workers.¹⁵⁰ HRW noted that the Labor Law included domestic workers but excluded them from protections.¹⁵¹

Right to work and to just and favourable conditions of work

37. JS7 recommended that Bahrain ensure that discrimination in the recruitment process is ameliorated, and especially discrimination against Shi'a in the public sector.¹⁵²

Right to social security

38. JS1 noted that despite the promulgation of a law in 2010 organizing the practice of domestic production activities, this law does not require these families to contribute to the social insurance system, which means that they can be considered among the categories of informal work. JS1 recommended extending the umbrella of social protection for women, especially those working in the informal economy.¹⁵³ MR recommended to meaningfully include migrant workers in Bahrain's social security system by extending the period of time that workers can remain in the country and access benefits and make benefits portable to the country of origin.¹⁵⁴

Right to health

39. ACFH noted that Bahrain has achieved success in the areas of health and nutrition.¹⁵⁵ MR noted that Bahrain enacted the "Law for the Prevention of Society from Acquired Immune Deficiency Syndrome" in 2017, including measures that protect those living with HIV from discrimination and from losing their jobs. However, migrant workers who test positive for HIV or other illnesses are deported immediately and are ineligible for residency and work permits. MR also noted that female migrants have limited access to postnatal and maternity care. MR recommended providing quality medical care to all migrants, including migrant women and domestic workers and ensure that healthcare should be equitable for all.¹⁵⁶

Right to education

40. BCN noted that Bahraini schools received an "insufficient" rating by the Training Quality Authority. BCN recommended allocating the necessary resources to ensure the high quality and accessibility of public education and regulate private schools to address inequality in the education system.¹⁵⁷ BCN recommended developing and promoting vocational training to enhance the skills of children, especially those who drop out of school, with a particular emphasis on those in rural areas.¹⁵⁸ JS1 recommended to make education compulsory up to the secondary stage, and to guarantee transparency in allocating scholarships.¹⁵⁹

41. BCN recommended to develop a comprehensive strategy aimed at improving water, sanitation, and hygiene in schools.¹⁶⁰

Development, the environment, and business and human rights

42. MR regretted that pollution and high heat, which increases each year are rising yearly due to climate change, disproportionately affect migrant workers who work outdoors and return home to overcrowded living spaces that further exacerbate vulnerability to respiratory disease. MR recommended reforming summer work bans to be based on real working temperatures, ensuring that workers have access to appropriate dress, occupational safety and health measures, and to increase inspection capacity.¹⁶¹

2. Rights of specific persons or groups

Women

43. GECHR noted the achievement of Bahrain in areas of women rights.¹⁶² JS3 recommended enforcing the National Plan for the Advancement of Bahraini Women to achieve its goal of improving the situation of women.¹⁶³

44. IDO and MAAT recommended ensuring Bahrain's domestic legal framework adheres to the requirements outlined in CEDAW.¹⁶⁴ ODVV recommended to make necessary efforts to reform all discriminatory legislation towards women and further its work in empowering women, promoting gender equality, and eliminating violence against women and girls.¹⁶⁵

45. Several submission noted that marital rape is not criminalized.¹⁶⁶ Several submissions noted that the penal code exempts perpetrators of rape from prosecution if they marry their victims.¹⁶⁷ Several submissions recommended repealing article 353 of the Penal Code.¹⁶⁸ MR recommended addressing loopholes in legislation that allow abusers to avoid prosecution in cases of domestic abuse and rape.¹⁶⁹ HRW, JS12 and JS3 noted that adultery and sexual relations outside of wedlock are criminalized by Article 316 of the Penal Code¹⁷⁰ and HRW recommended repealing Article 316.¹⁷¹ HRW, UNDUPRC and JS3 noted that Article 334 states that penalties can be reduced for perpetrators of honor crimes including honor killings¹⁷², and HRW, JS3 and JS12 recommended repealing it.¹⁷³

46. MR and NCF noted that abortion is only permitted when the mother's life is medically endangered.¹⁷⁴ NCF recommended the expansion of abortion rights to include abortions for rape victims.¹⁷⁵ MR recommended decriminalising abortion.¹⁷⁶

47. JS1 noted that although Bahrain has enacted Law No. (17) concerning Protection against Domestic Violence, this law is limited to family violence, excluding violence in public space. JS1 recommended amending this law to include violence in the public space, threat of violence, marital rape and determine related punishment and non-Bahraini women. JS1 also recommended implementing awareness programs in cooperation with civil society institutions concerning the phenomenon of violence and methods of protection.¹⁷⁷

48. JS3 and UNDUPRC noted that the role of women in the labor sector is restricted under articles 59, 60 et 62.¹⁷⁸ JS3 recommended reforming the Labour Law for the Private Sector or amend these articles.¹⁷⁹ MAAT noted positive steps to empower women in the labour market and recommended to continue to empower women economically, politically and socially, and allow them to effectively participate in various work sectors.¹⁸⁰

Children

49. JS4 noted that the Kingdom legalizes child marriage in contravention to its obligation under the CRC.¹⁸¹ JS3, UNDUPRC and NCF noted that Article 20 of the Family Law allows girls younger than 16 years old to be married with the permission of the specialized Islamic court upon verifying the suitability of the marriage.¹⁸² JS1 and JS3 recommended to raise the marriageable age for girls to 18 Gregorian years instead of 16.¹⁸³

50. End Violence and HRW noted that despite the supported recommendation in the 2017 UPR cycle and the recommendations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child to prohibit corporal punishment against children in all settings, Bahrain did not comply.¹⁸⁴ End Violence and HRW recommended that Bahrain introduce legislation that clearly prohibits corporal punishment in all contexts.¹⁸⁵ BCN recommended raising awareness on issues of concern such as violence, abuse and bullying in schools.¹⁸⁶

51. BCN recommended that Bahrain pay more attention to children living in poverty, children in rural areas, and children with disabilities.¹⁸⁷

Lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender and intersex persons

52. HRW and JS3 noted that although no law explicitly criminalizes same-sex relations, authorities have used vague penal code provisions against "indecent" and "immorality" to target sexual and gender minorities.¹⁸⁸

Migrants, refugees and asylum-seekers

53. HRW and JS14 noted that in its 2017 UPR, Bahrain was urged to ensure effective protection of migrant workers, through legislative measures.¹⁸⁹ HRW, IDO and JS3 recommended amending provisions in Labour Law for the Private Sector to include domestic workers in the protections afforded.¹⁹⁰ IDO noted Law No. 36 (2012) do not apply to “domestic servants”, leaving domestic workers without any formal protection.¹⁹¹ MR noted that domestic workers are explicitly excluded in Decree (59) in 2018 regarding discrimination and sexual harassment in the workplace, despite the exceptional prevalence of harassment they face.¹⁹² HRW and JS7 recommended revising the Labour law to ensure equal protections to domestic workers.¹⁹³ JS9 and MR recommended to strengthen anti-discrimination legislation to ensure that foreign nationals are treated equally before the law.¹⁹⁴ MR recommended establishing a non-discriminatory national minimum wage and prohibiting recruitment agencies from linking wages for domestic workers to their nationalities.¹⁹⁵ IDO recommended enforcing inspections of migrant’s living accommodations to ensure decent and sanitary living environments.¹⁹⁶

54. HRW noted that abuses against migrant workers worsened during the Covid-19 pandemic. In 2020, authorities paid citizen’s salaries but not to migrant workers, who reported facing dismissal, wage theft and evictions from their accommodation.¹⁹⁷

55. HRW noted that in 2009, Bahrain allowed migrant workers to terminate their employment contracts after one year with their first employer as long as they give at least 30 days reasonable notice. In 2022, the Parliament voted to extend this to two years. Workers are also expected to bear their own fees for the two-year work permit, which has been too onerous for many resulting in little take-up.¹⁹⁸ MR, ODVV and JS14 also noted that the Kafala system gives employers broad control over the residency status of their non-national employees.¹⁹⁹ MAAT noted positive developments in advancing migrant workers’ rights and recommended introducing legal legislation to ensure better protection of their rights, and establishing a preventive mechanism for domestic workers to ensure that they are not subjected to forced labor or physical or psychological abuse.²⁰⁰ MR and HRW recommended that Bahrain dissociate workers’ residence status from their employment status.²⁰¹ MR recommended enforcing administrative and criminal penalties against errant employers and recruitment agencies, and uphold penalties against those who confiscate workers’ identity documents.²⁰²

56. BCN recommended creating a supportive legal framework that encourages the inclusion of migrant/refugee children into formal schools.²⁰³

Stateless persons

57. Several submissions noted that Bahrain’s Citizenship Law of 1963 prohibits the passage of citizenship from women to her child.²⁰⁴ NIHR and several submissions recommended that Bahrain amend this law to allow women to pass their citizenship onto their children on an equal basis to men.²⁰⁵ JS13 also recommended preventing naturalized Bahraini women from automatically losing their nationality upon termination of marriage.²⁰⁶

58. MAAT noted an increase in the number of “stateless” children.²⁰⁷ ECDHR recommended that Bahrain implement specific legislation to protect and guarantee the rights of children born to stateless parents due to the extensive and often arbitrary use of citizenship revocation by authorities.²⁰⁸ JS7 and JS13 recommended restoring citizenship to those made stateless.²⁰⁹ MAAT, JS13 and JS7 recommended protecting everyone’s right to a nationality, and ensuring that national laws comply with international obligations.²¹⁰ JS13 recommended a moratorium on the practice of nationality deprivations.²¹¹

59. JS5 recommended Bahrain to further reform excessively broad nationality laws that create statelessness.²¹² JS5 recommended creating a system for the government to collect information and track the remaining statelessness cases in Bahrain and the profiles of these various stateless groups.²¹³

Notes

- ¹ The stakeholders listed below have contributed information for this summary; the full texts of all original submissions are available at: www.ohchr.org.

Civil society

Individual submissions:

ACFH	Ahwazi Centre for Human Rights, London (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);
ADF	ADF International ‘Alliance Defending Freedom’, Geneva (Switzerland);
ADHRB	Americans for Democracy & Human Rights in Bahrain (ADHRB), Washington, DC (United States of America);
AF	Alsalam Foundation, London (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);;
BHRS	Bahrain Human Rights Society, Manama (Bahrain);
BHRWS	Bahrain Human Rights Watch Society, London, (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);
BTS	Bahrain Transparency Society, Manama, (Bahrain);
BCN	The Stichting Broken Chalk, Amsterdam, (Netherlands);
ECDHR	European Centre for Democracy and Human Rights, Brussels (Belgium);
BFHR	Bahrain Forum For Human Rights, Manama, (Bahrain);
ECLJ	European Centre for Law and Justice, Strasbourg (France)
End Violence	The Global Partnership to End Violence Against Children New York (United States of America);
GECHR	Gulf European Centre for Human Rights, London, (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);
HRW	Human Rights WATCH, New York (United States of America);
ICAN	International Campaign to Abolish Nuclear Weapons, Geneva (Switzerland)
ICSRF	The International Center for supporting Rights and Freedoms (ICSRF), Cairo (Egypt);
IHRC	Islamic Human Rights Commissions, Wembley (United Kingdom);
IDO	Iraqi Development Organization, Baghdad (Iraq);
KRC	Khiam Rehabilitation Center for Victims of Torture, Beirut (Lebanon);
MAAT	The Maat Foundation for Peace, Development and Human Rights, Cairo (Egypt);
MR	Migrant-Rights.org, Baarn, (Netherlands)
ODVV	The Organization for Defending Victims of Violence (ODVV), Tehran (Iran (Islamic Republic of));
SALAM DHR	SALAM for Democracy and Human Rights, London (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);
NCF	The Next Century Foundation, Cornwall, (United Kingdom);
UNDUPRC	The University of Notre Dame International Human Rights Clinic, Notre Dame (United States of America).

Joint submissions:

JS1	Joint submission 1 submitted by: Bahrain Women Union, Alguffair (Bahrain); Bahrain Young Ladies Association, Manama (Bahrain); Awal Women Society, Arad (Bahrain); Contemporary Women Society, Manama (Bahrain); International ladies association, Manama (Bahrain); Bahrain Women Society, Adliya (Bahrain); Bahrain Women Association for human development, Manama (Bahrain); Al-Reef Young SOCIETY, Manama (Bahrain); Al Muntalaq Women Society, Jaww (Bahrain); Bahrain Women Association for Human Development, Manama, (Bahrain) and Madinat Hamad Women Society;
JS2	Joint submission 2 submitted by: Americans for Democracy & Human Rights in Bahrain (ADHRB), Washington, DC

- (United States of America) and the European Center for Democracy and Human Rights (ECDHR), Brussels (Belgium);
- JS3 **Joint submission 3 submitted by:** Americans for Democracy & Human Rights in Bahrain (ADHRB), Washington, DC (United States of America); Iraqi Development Organization (IDO), Baghdad (Iraq and the United Kingdom) and European Center for Democracy and Human Rights (ECDHR), Brussels (Belgium);
- JS4 **Joint submission 4 submitted by:** Americans for Democracy & Human Rights in Bahrain (ADHRB), Washington, DC (United States of America) and Iraqi Development Organization (IDO), Baghdad (Iraq);
- JS5 **Joint submission 5 submitted by:** Bahrain Center for Human Rights (BCHR) København, (Denmark) and RAFTO Foundation for Human Rights, Bergen (Norway);
- JS6 **Joint submission 6 submitted by:** Americans for Democracy & Human Rights in Bahrain (ADHRB), Washington, DC (United States of America) and Alsalam Foundation London (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland);
- JS7 **Joint submission 7 submitted by:** Salam for Democracy and Human Rights (SALAM DHR), London (United Kingdom); Gulf Institute for Democracy and Human Rights (GIDHR), Sidney, Australia; Bahrain Forum for Human Rights (BFHR), (Bahrain) and Human Rights Sentinel, Dublin, (Ireland);
- JS8 **Joint submission 8 submitted by:** Bahrain Human Rights Watch Society, Manama, Bahrain (Bahrain); Karama Human Rights Society and Group of Independent Human Rights Activists;
- JS9 **Joint submission 9 submitted by:** Reprieve and Bahrain Institute for Rights and Democracy (BIRD), (United Kingdom);
- JS10 **Joint submission 10 submitted by:** Americans for Democracy & Human Rights in Bahrain (ADHRB), Washington, DC (United States of America) and Bahrain Institute for Rights & Democracy (BIRD), (United Kingdom);
- JS11 **Joint submission 11 submitted by:** Salam for Democracy and Human Rights (SALAM DHR), London (United Kingdom); Bahrain Center Against Torture, Beirut (Lebanon) and World Organisation Against Torture (OMCT), Tunis (Tunisie);
- JS12 **Joint submission 12 submitted by:** Americans for Democracy & Human Rights in Bahrain (ADHRB), Washington, DC (United States of America); Bahrain Center for Human Rights (BCHR), København, (Denmark); Fédération internationale pour les droits humains, (FIDH), Paris (France); and Gulf Centre for Human Rights (GCHR), (Lebanon);
- JS13 **Joint submission 13 submitted by:** Salam for Democracy and Human Rights (SALAM DHR) London (United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland); Rights Realization Centre (RRC), London (United Kingdom); MENA Statelessness Network (Hawiati), Beirut (Lebanon), Global Campaign for Equal Nationality Rights (GCENR), New York (United States of America); and Institute on Statelessness and Inclusion (ISI), Eindhoven, (Netherlands).
- JS14 **Joint submission 14 submitted by:** SALAM for Democracy and Human Rights (SALAM DHR), London (United Kingdom) and Rights Realization Centre (RRC) London (United Kingdom).
- JS15 **Joint submission 15 submitted by:** Access Now, New York (United States of America) and Red line for Gulf

National human rights institution:

- NIHR National Institution for Human Rights, Manama (Bahrain).
- ² See A/HRC/36/3, A/HRC/36/3/Add.1, and A/HRC/36/2.
- ³ The following abbreviations are used in UPR documents:
- | | |
|------------|--|
| ICERD | International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination; |
| ICESCR | International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; |
| OP-ICESCR | Optional Protocol to ICESCR; |
| ICCPR | International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights; |
| ICCPR-OP 1 | Optional Protocol to ICCPR; |
| ICCPR-OP 2 | Second Optional Protocol to ICCPR, aiming at the abolition of the death penalty; |
| CEDAW | Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women; |
| OP-CEDAW | Optional Protocol to CEDAW; |
| CAT | Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment; |
| OP-CAT | Optional Protocol to CAT; |
| CRC | Convention on the Rights of the Child; |
| OP-CRC-AC | Optional Protocol to CRC on the involvement of children in armed conflict; |
| OP-CRC-SC | Optional Protocol to CRC on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography; |
| OP-CRC-IC | Optional Protocol to CRC on a communications procedure; |
| ICRMW | International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families; |
| CRPD | Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities; |
| OP-CRPD | Optional Protocol to CRPD; |
| ICPPED | International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance. |
- ⁴ MAAT, p. 5.
- ⁵ JS9, p. 12.
- ⁶ MAAT, p. 1; JS9, p. 12.
- ⁷ MAAT, p. 1.
- ⁸ IDO, para. 23; JS1, p. 3; JS4, para. 41; JS12, para. 10.8.1.
- ⁹ Alsalam Foundation, para. 31; MAAT, p. 1; NIHR, para. 30; JS5, para. 19; JS7, para. 54; JS9, p. 12; JS11, para. 31; JS12, para. 10.4.3.
- ¹⁰ NIHR, para. 30; JS6, para. 38; JS12, para. 10.4.3.
- ¹¹ MR, p. 2; NIHR, para. 30.
- ¹² JS3, para. 31.
- ¹³ MAAT, p. 1.
- ¹⁴ GECHR, p. 3; JS1, p. 3; JS3, para. 47; JS4, para. 41; JS7, para. 23.
- ¹⁵ NIHR, para. 6; JS12, para. 10.8.1; JS13, p. 13.
- ¹⁶ HRW, para.1; JS4, para. 33.
- ¹⁷ JS4, para. 33.
- ¹⁸ HRW, para. 12; NCF, para. 41; JS15, para. 24.
- ¹⁹ HRW, para. 12; NCF, para. 41; JS15, para. 24.
- ²⁰ AF, para. 31; HRW, para. 19; NCF, para. 41; JS5, para. 19; JS6, para. 38; JS7, para. 54; JS9, p. 12; JS11, para. 31; JS12, para. 10.4.4; JS15, para. 24.
- ²¹ IHRC, p. 5; MAAT, p. 5; JS11, para. 31; JS15, para. 24.
- ²² MAAT, p. 5.
- ²³ JS12, para. 10.4.4.
- ²⁴ HRW, para. 31; ICSRF, p. 4.
- ²⁵ MR, p. 10; JS1, p. 13.
- ²⁶ JS6, para. 11; JS14, para. 35.
- ²⁷ MAAT, p. 1; JS13, p. 13.
- ²⁸ MAAT, p. 1.
- ²⁹ ICAN, p. 1.
- ³⁰ NIHR, para. 31.
- ³¹ <https://www.ohchr.org/en/hr-bodies/upr/upr-implementation>
- ³² ICSRF, p. 1, A/HRC/36/3, UPR recommendations Nos: 114.33, 114.4, 114.162, 114.19, 114.27, 114.22, 114.26, 114.31, 114.20, 114.35, 114.105, 114.42, 114.82, 114.62, 114.106, 114.107,

- 114.102, 114.108, 114.113, 114.110, 114.98, 114.116, 114.127, 114.172, 114.151, 114.152, 114.149, 114.133, 114.137, 114.134, 114.153, 114.161, 114.154, 114.126, 114.51, 114.64, 114.66, 114.169, 114.39, 114.139, 114.157, 114.140, 114.45, 114.46, 114.47, 114.49, 114.32, 114.54, 114.53, 114.55, 114.37, 114.58, 114.59, 114.80, 114.87, 114.130, 114.70, 114.96, 114.78, 114.17, 114.81, 114.79, 114.83, 114.94, 114.112, 114.100, 114.167, 114.104, 114.117, 114.61, 114.99, 114.115, 114.97, 114.109, 114.101, 114.122, 114.123.
- ³³ ICSRF, p. 4.
- ³⁴ BHRWS, p. 5.
- ³⁵ JS11, para. 9.1.
- ³⁶ NIHR, paras. 14–15.
- ³⁷ JS5, para. 19; JS12, para. 10.9.6.
- ³⁸ JS12, para. 10.9.1.
- ³⁹ MAAT, p. 2; JS5, para. 19; JS6, para. 38; JS12, para. 10.9.1.
- ⁴⁰ JS14, para. 28.
- ⁴¹ HRW, para. 42; NIHR, para. 26.
- ⁴² NIHR, para. 26.
- ⁴³ HRW, paras. 42–43.
- ⁴⁴ ADF, para. 19; JS4, para. 34; JS6, paras. 21, 36; JS12, para. 7.1; JS14, paras. 29–34.
- ⁴⁵ JS7, para. 12.
- ⁴⁶ UNDUPRC, para. 25; JS12, para. 7.2.
- ⁴⁷ ADF, para. 35; JS12, para. 10.7.1.
- ⁴⁸ ADF, para. 35.
- ⁴⁹ JS9, paras. 14–15.
- ⁵⁰ MAAT, p.3.
- ⁵¹ BHRS, para.32.
- ⁵² HRW, para. 13; JS9, para. 6.
- ⁵³ BHRS, para. 33; HRW, para.19; NIHR, para. 38; JS7, para. 96; JS9, para. 11; JS10, para. 73; JS11, para. 31.
- ⁵⁴ ICSRF, para. 6.
- ⁵⁵ JS9, p. 5.
- ⁵⁶ NIHR, para. 38.
- ⁵⁷ JS4, para. 7; JS12, para. 4.4.
- ⁵⁸ ICSRF, para. 19.
- ⁵⁹ AF, para. 5; JS11, para. 4.
- ⁶⁰ AF, para. 5.
- ⁶¹ AF, para. 31.
- ⁶² JS4, para. 7.
- ⁶³ JS2, paras. 14, 21, 26–27, 39; JS7, paras. 88, 91, 93; JS10, para. 30; JS12, para. 6.3.
- ⁶⁴ JS12, para. 10.6.2.
- ⁶⁵ JS7, para. 30.
- ⁶⁶ AF, paras. 8–9; HRW, para.22; JS2, paras. 26, 39; JS4, para. 6; JS9, paras. 21, 27; JS11, para. 12; JS12, para. 4.2, 10.6.3.
- ⁶⁷ BFHR, pp. 2–4.
- ⁶⁸ AF, para. 31; HRW, para. 19; MAAT p. 2; JS7, para. 54; JS9, p. 12; JS11, para. 31; JS12, para. 10.5.2.
- ⁶⁹ MAAT, p. 2; JS9, p. 12; JS11, para. 31.
- ⁷⁰ IHRC, p. 5; JS5, para.19.
- ⁷¹ JS9, p. 12.
- ⁷² JS5, para. 19; JS12, para. 10.9.4.
- ⁷³ MAAT, p. 2; JS5, para. 19; JS6, para. 38; JS12, para. 10.9.3.
- ⁷⁴ JS9, p. 11.
- ⁷⁵ AF, para. 31; JS6, para. 38; JS9, p. 12; JS11, para. 31; JS12, para. 10.4.2.
- ⁷⁶ AF, para. 19; HRW, para. 23; MAAT, p. 2; UNDUPRC, paras. 8–9; JS4, para. 53; JS7, para. 54; JS10, paras. 2, 8–10, 27–29; JS11, para. 23.
- ⁷⁷ JS2, paras. 5, 14, 26, 34; JS7, para. 91; JS12, para. 6.3.
- ⁷⁸ HRW, para. 31; ICSRF, pp. 8 and 9; MAAT, p. 2; NCF, para. 26; JS6, para. 38; JS7, para. 30.
- ⁷⁹ JS7, para. 30.
- ⁸⁰ AF, para.31; MAAT, p. 5; JS6, para. 38.
- ⁸¹ HRW, para. 48; JS2, paras. 37, 39; JS10, para. 66.
- ⁸² HRW, para. 31; ICSRF, p. 9; JS12, para. 10.3.3.
- ⁸³ JS4, para. 39; JS5, para. 6.
- ⁸⁴ JS5, para. 12; JS10, para. 64.

- 85 JS5, para. 12.
86 NIHR, para. 7.
87 JS12, para. 10.4.1.
88 KRC, pp. 5–7 and 20.
89 BHRS, para.29; KRC, pp. 5–7 and 20.
90 ECDHR, paras. 8–9; IHRC, para. 2; JS2, para. 10; JS4, para. 18; JS5, para. 8; JS10, paras. 36–38; JS11, para. 23; JS12, para. 4.4.
91 BFHR, pp. 2–4.
92 JS5, para. 19.
93 ICSRF, p. 8.
94 ICSRF, para. 8; JS12, para. 10.3.1.
95 BTS, paras. 6–7, 9.
96 BHRWS, p. 4; BTS, paras.14, 17, 21, 22, 26–27, 32, and 35.
97 BTS, paras.14, 17, 21, 22, 26–27, 32 and 35.
98 ADF, paras. 8–9; ECLJ, para. 15.
99 ADF, para. 29; JS12, para. 2.2.
100 ABHRB, para. 7; ADF, para. 29.
101 ADF, paras. 6 and 15.
102 ECLJ, paras. 13 and 17.
103 BFHR, pp. 3–6.
104 BHRWS, p. 5.
105 ADF, para. 12; ECLJ, para. 13; JS12, para. 7.5.
106 ADF, para. 35.
107 MAAT, p. 1.
108 NCF, para. 23.
109 ADHRB, para. 8; JS4, para. 22; JS10, paras. 51–58; JS15, para. 9.
110 JS4, para. 27.
111 JS10, para. 49.a.
112 ADHRB, para. 23; JS10, para. 63.
113 BHRS, paras.12 and 20; BTS, paras. 62–69; JS1, p. 1.
114 NIHR, para. 37.
115 JS12, para. 5.1.
116 ADHRB, para. 23; HRW, para.12; IHRC, p. 5; MAAT, p. 5; NCF, para. 26; ODVV, para. 18; JS7, para. 3; JS10, paras. 62, 67–69; JS12, para. 10.2.1; JS15, para. 24.
117 HRW, para.12.
118 HRW, para. 3; ODVV, p. 5; JS4, para. 23.
119 HRW, para. 3; ODVV, p. 5; JS4, para. 23; JS15, para. 9.
120 HRW, para. 4; MAAT, p. 1; ODVV, p. 5.
121 HRW, para. 12.
122 JS15, para. 24.
123 ADHRB, para. 21.
124 ADHRB, para. 23.
125 BHRS, paras. 1–2; BTS, paras. 42–47; NCF, para. 6; Salam DHR, para. 22; JS7, para. 36.
126 BHRS, paras. 1–2.
127 BHRS, paras. 8–11; BTS, paras. 57–58; NCF, para. 6; Salam DHR, para. 28; JS1, p. 2.
128 BHRS, paras. 1, 2 and 4; BTS, para. 55; NCF, para. 11; Salam DHR, para. 36; JS7, para. 36.
129 NCF, para. 13.
130 BHRS, paras. 46–47; JS4, para. 37.
131 JS12, para. 2.3.
132 BHRS, para. 48.
133 BHRS, paras. 37–39.
134 Salam DHR, para. 36; JS7, para. 36.
135 JS10, para. 71.
136 JS1, pp. 7 and 8; JS3, paras. 35–36; JS12, para. 8.6.
137 JS1, p. 8.
138 HRW, paras. 5, 12.
139 HRW, para.5; UNDUPRC, para. 5; JS5, para. 45; JS15, para. 16.
140 JS12, para. 10.5.4; JS15, para. 24.
141 HRW, para. 17.
142 JS3, para. 4; JS12, paras. 8.1–8.4.
143 JS4, para. 43.
144 UNDUPRC, para. 27; JS1, pp. 5 and 6; JS3, para. 13; JS4, para. 43.

- 145 JS12, para. 10.8.2.
146 ECLJ, paras. 11–12.
147 JS1, pp. 12 and 13.
148 MR, p. 5.
149 MR, p. 5.
150 JS1, pp. 12 and 13.
151 HRW, paras. 36–37.
152 JS7, para. 12.
153 JS1, pp. 8 and 9.
154 MR, p. 7.
155 ACFH, p. 2.
156 MR, p. 7.
157 BCN, paras. 11, 18 and 19.
158 BCN, para. 21.
159 JS1, p. 13.
160 BCN, para. 20.
161 MR, p. 3.
162 GECHR, p. 3.
163 JS3, para. 47.
164 IDO, para. 23; MAAT, p. 5.
165 ODVV, para. 21.
166 MR, p. 10; UNDUPRC, para. 29; JS1, p. 4; JS3, para.3; JS12, para. 8.5.
167 HRW, para. 40; IDO, para. 19; NCF, para. 31; ODVV, para. 12; UNDUPRC, para. 29; JS1, p. 4; JS3, para. 3; JS4, para. 45; JS7, para. 23; JS12, para. 8.5; JS13, para.28.
168 HRW, para. 43; IDO, para. 23; NCF, para. 32; JS1, pp. 4 and 5; JS3, para. 47; JS7, para. 23; JS12, para. 10.8.3; JS13, p. 13.
169 MR, p. 10.
170 HRW, para. 41; JS3, para. 3; JS12, para. 8.5.
171 HRW, para. 43.
172 HRW, paras. 40–41; UNDUPRC, para. 30; JS3, para.3.
173 HRW, paras. 40–41; JS3, paras. 3, 47; JS12, para. 10.8.3.
174 MR, pp. 9 and 10; NCF, para. 32.
175 NCF, para. 32.
176 MR, pp. 9 and 10.
177 JS1, p. 4.
178 UNDUPRC, para. 30; JS3, paras. 18, 47.
179 JS3, paras. 18, 47.
180 MAAT, pp. 2–3 and 5.
181 JS4, para. 43.
182 NCF, para. 33; UNDUPRC, para. 27; JS3, para. 15.
183 JS1, p. 5; JS3, para. 47.
184 End violence, paras. 1.1, 3.1; HRW, para. 47.
185 End violence, para. 1.3; HRW, paras. 47 and 48.
186 BCN, para. 15.
187 BCN, para. 16.
188 HRW, para. 41; JS3, para. 3.
189 HRW, para. 32; JS14, para. 6.
190 HRW, para. 37; IDO, para. 23; JS3, para. 47.
191 IDO, para. 17.
192 MR, pp. 1 and 2.
193 HRW, paras. 36–37, JS7, para. 12.
194 MR, pp. 1 and 2; J9, p. 11.
195 MR, pp. 1 and 2.
196 IDO, para. 23.
197 HRW, paras. 33–34.
198 HRW, para. 35.
199 MR, pp. 4; ODVV, para. 10; JS14, para. 10.
200 MAAT, pp. 4 and 5.
201 HRW, paras. 35 and 37; MR, p. 4.
202 MR, p. 4.
203 BCN, paras. 22–23.
204 ECDHR, para. 22; HRW, para. 43; NCF, para. 30; ODVV, para. 13; JS1, p. 3; JS3, para. 5; JS4, para.

44; JS5, paras. 2–5; JS7, para. 68; JS12, para. 8.3; JS13, para. 24.

²⁰⁵ BHRWS, p. 4; ECDHR, para. 22; GECHR, p. 3; HRW, para. 43; MAAT, pp. 3 and 5; MR, p. 9; NCF, para. 30; NIHR, para. 5; ODVV, para. 22; JS1, p. 3; JS3, para. 5; JS5, para. 12; JS7, para. 68; JS12, para. 10.8.2; JS13, p. 13.

²⁰⁶ JS13, p. 13.

²⁰⁷ MAAT, p. 4.

²⁰⁸ ECDHR, para. 22.

²⁰⁹ JS7, para. 68; JS13, p. 13.

²¹⁰ MAAT, p. 5; JS7, para. 68; JS13, p. 13.

²¹¹ JS14, p. 13.

²¹² JS5, para. 12.

²¹³ JS5, para. 12.
