



Stakeholders' Report on Right to Food in Bangladesh

Submission to the Universal Periodic Review of Bangladesh

**UPR Working Group of the Human Rights Council
16th session (22 Apr-3 May 2013)**

Joint Submission of Campaign for Sustainable Rural Livelihood (CSRL) and Oxfam

www.oxfam.org.uk

www.csrlbd.org

I. Methodology:

1. This stakeholders' report has been prepared jointly by Oxfam¹ and a national alliance CSRL² (Campaign for Sustainable Rural Livelihood) in Bangladesh (**Annex 1 for the description of Oxfam and CSRL alliance**). This report is particularly focused on the right to food situation of Bangladesh and is based on several consultations organized as part of the report preparation process. Various available secondary sources of information like publications of both government and non government organizations and other documentation, experience of Oxfam and CSRL have been referred in this report. The draft report has also been shared with relevant individuals and organizations³ including National Human Rights Commission. This report has been developed following the guidelines adopted by the Human Rights Council. Apart from acknowledging the progress made so far, the report endeavors to highlight the challenges and concerns associated with improving the right to food situation. This report also put forward several specific recommendations relevant for Bangladesh and the international community to act upon in order to achieve the progressive realization of the right to food for the people of Bangladesh.

II. Constitutional and Legislative Framework on Right to Food

2. The Bangladesh Constitution recognizes the state's responsibility to all citizens' right to food in part 2 of the Constitution, though strictly not as a fundamental right, but as a part of the fundamental principle of state. Through the provision of article 11, the Constitution guarantees the fundamental human rights and freedoms and respect for the dignity and worth of the human person. Article 15(a) of the Constitution stipulates the fundamental responsibility of the state to securing for its citizens the provision of the basic necessities of life, including food, clothing, shelter, education and medical care.

III. Bangladesh's International Commitments on Right to Food:

3. Bangladesh has ratified almost all of the international core human rights treaties (**Annex II**). By ratifying the International Covenant on Economic Social and Cultural rights (ICESCR) Bangladesh has undertaken specific obligations to ensure right to food, a fundamental human right for its citizens. As a signatory to the Vienna Declaration and Program of Action adopted by the World Conference on Human Rights in 1993 Bangladesh, Bangladesh has expressed its commitment to implementing the Declaration on the Right to Development adopted by the United Nations in 1986. Bangladesh has also made commitments to cut by half the number of people suffering from hunger and malnutrition by 2015 under the World Food Summit Declaration and the UN Millennium Declaration.

4. Bangladesh is serving as a member of the UN Human Rights Council for two consecutive terms. Prior to offering its candidature for the second term, Bangladesh made voluntary pledges towards human rights which included commitments to intensify its efforts, while framing its national policies and strategies, to uphold the fundamental principles enshrined in the Constitution of Bangladesh as well as those of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights and other international and regional human rights instruments to which it is a party. This includes its commitment to **enhance efforts to ensure the provision of basic**

¹ Oxfam GB is an international NGO based in UK (www.oxfam.org.uk), Bangladesh country office works on various issues including food security. Oxfam launched a global campaign named GROW in 2011. As one of the Focus Country OGB Bangladesh organized consultation on food security situations as a part of its national campaign.

² CSRL is a national alliance of approximately 250 local and national civil society organizations and networks launched in 2007, facilitated by Oxfam GB in Bangladesh.

³ Among other individuals and organizations, WAVE Foundation, VSO Bangladesh, Inner Power, Institute for Environment and Development (IED), ActionAid Bangladesh, INCIDIN Bangladesh, IFSN, SUPRO, BLAST, Bangladesh Unnayan Parishad (BUP), Angikar Bangladesh, Campaign for Right to Food and Social Security and UNDP Bangladesh have been consulted throughout the report preparation process.

necessities to its people, including food, clothing, shelter, education and primary health care as a means of effectively enjoying all human rights, and strengthen efforts to meet its obligations under the treaty bodies to which it is a party through the effective implementation of relevant national programs. Under the first Universal Periodic Review, Bangladesh accepted the recommendation to continue its efforts to ensure the right to food for the citizens.

IV. Bangladesh's Policy and Program Framework:

5. Bangladesh has a comprehensive food security policy framework that includes National Food Policy 2006, accompanied by the National Food Policy and Plan of Action (2008-2015), and an investment plan named the Bangladesh Country Investment Plan, a road map towards investment in agriculture, food security and nutrition. Besides, the specific policy framework on food security, food security issues have been well reflected in other major policy and program documents, such as, '*Perspective Plan of Bangladesh 2010-2021: Making Vision 2021 a Reality*', *Sixth Five Year Plan for FY 2011-2015*.

V. Right to Food Situation on the Ground:

6. As a universally recognized human right, the right to food entails the availability and accessibility of adequate food meeting dietary needs (ensuring all constituents namely, carbohydrates; proteins (both of animal and vegetable origins), fats (both of animal and vegetable origins), vitamins and Minerals both in terms of quantity and quality. It also states that food availability has to be ensured on a sustainable basis and should not be compromised even in the wake of vulnerabilities either man-made or those finding their origins in extreme natural events. Very positively, National Food Policy 2006 outlines the strategies and objectives covering all three elements: availability, access and utilization. The National Food Policy 2006 objectives are: *adequate and stable supply of safe and nutritious food, increased purchasing power and access to food of the people, and adequate nutrition for all individuals, especially for women and children*. Accordingly, the National Food Policy and Plan of Action (2008-2015) set the targeted actions to achieve the goal and the **Country Investment Plan 2011** states the corresponding investment requirements in line with the Sixth Five Year Plan and the Millennium Development Goals.

7. Despite Bangladesh's firm commitment to create provisions for food for its citizens, the state of food security in Bangladesh is still not satisfactory. The Global Hunger Index 2011 ranked Bangladesh 70th among the 81 countries where Global Food Security Index 2012 ranked Bangladesh 81st among 105 countries.

Food Availability:

9. In recent years, Bangladesh has made progress in food grain production thereby stepping towards being self sufficient in rice (**Table 1 & 2**). In the past four decades since independence in 1971, the country has been successful in increasing its rice production from a mere 0.8 Million Metric Tonnes to 3.5 Million Metric Tonnes. This daunting task has been achieved against the backdrop of a growing population, decreasing agricultural lands, and frequently occurring natural hazards, all of which tend to adversely affect food production. Agriculture is critically important in ensuring food security by enhancing food production, generating more jobs and increasing the income of farmers. Various ongoing government initiatives to promote agricultural growth include: framing National Agricultural Policy 2011, providing 'Agricultural Inputs Support Card' to the farmers across the country, delivering the opportunity of opening a bank account by depositing only Tk.10 (12 cents), introducing crop insurance schemes in a pilot scale to test efficacy, distribution of fair price cards among the poor farmers for inputs, forming Farmers Club and Marketing Groups, and providing credit facilities to the farmers. Some other

initiatives as forecasted in the budget statement 2012-13 include: enacting ‘Bangladesh Agricultural Research Council Act, 2012’, and increasing the number of the agricultural information communication centers.

Table 1: Projected Food Grain Requirement and Production

Figures in thousands metric tons

Year	Food grain requirement	Net Total production
2010	24519.60	27587.04
2015	25943.42	29797.54

Source: Ministry of Agriculture

Table 2: Total food grain production: lac metric tons

Food grain	2003-04	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11*
<i>Aus</i>	18.32	15.00	17.45	15.12	15.07	18.95	17.09	21.33
<i>Aman</i>	115.21	98.20	108.10	108.41	96.62	116.13	133.07	127.91
<i>Boro</i>	128.37	138.37	139.75	149.65	177.62	178.09	183.41	186.17
Total Rice	261.90	251.57	265.53	273.18	289.31	313.17	322.57	335.41
Wheat	12.53	9.76	7.35	7.25	8.44	8.44	9.69	9.72
Maize	2.41	3.56	5.22	8.99	13.46	7.30	8.87	15.52
Total	276.44	264.89	277.87	289.42	311.21	328.96	341.13	360.65

Source: Bangladesh Economic Review 2011, Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS). * DAE

10. Despite approaching self-sufficiency in rice, to ensure food availability in a sustainable manner, challenges remain in many areas. However, monitoring adequacy and stability of food supply is challenging because of data limitations⁴. The conversion of arable land for non-agricultural purposes, mining of essential nutrients and micro-nutrients and organic carbon from the top soils, and the depletion of ground water, are major challenges to be faced in sustaining future productive capacity. A recent study⁵ found that between 2001 and 2008, the conversion of agricultural land to nonagricultural was 0.56% with an associated loss of rice production estimated to have been between 0.86 and 1.16 %.

11. A huge quantity of water, mostly from ground water aquifer sources across the country, is utilized in paddy fields to compensate for moisture stress. In absence of a regulation towards using groundwater tube wells, the resource base is now at risk of declining piezometric surface, especially in areas where the irrigation demand is very high. The long term sustainability of the resource base is now at risk, which warrants immediate actions towards efficiently used groundwater resources and the technologies (such as the AWD) that ensure judicious use of the declining resource.

12. The climate change caused by global warming has also appeared as a severe threat to subsistence scale agricultural production in future. On the one hand, CO₂ fertilization will facilitate the increase in yield at low levels of warming, perhaps up to 2°C. In the other hand, CO₂ fertilization beyond 2°C regime will tend to lose out against adverse effects of rising temperature on C3 crops, while C4 crops (non-staple

⁴ Food Policy Action Plan and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012, page 10).

⁵ Quasem, M A. (2011) Conversion of Agricultural Land to Non-agricultural Uses in Bangladesh: Extents and Determinants Bangladesh Development Studies, Vol. XXXIV, March No.1.

crops in Bangladesh) might still be giving good yields. With specific reference to food grains, the United Nations Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) estimates that, in Bangladesh, by 2050, changing rainfall patterns with increasing temperatures, flooding, droughts and salinity (in the coastal belt) could cause an 8% and 32% decline in rice and wheat production respectively, compared to 1990 (Rashid et al., 2009). Increased population pressure is another challenge to meet the growing demands of balanced food⁶ from in-country production and number of climate induced displaced may increase.

13. Farmers' access to markets, optimizing inputs (fertilizer and irrigation), improving farmers' profits, etc appear to be equally important. Since the majority of the farmers are small and marginalized (**Annex III**), they need incentives in the production of high cost agricultural products. However, high production costs compounded with inadequate and inefficient subsidy mechanism, lack of fair price of agricultural products⁷, lack of adequate storage facilities, faulty public procurement system and problems related to farmers' access to market are some of the major constraints faced by small and marginal farmers. These challenges make resource poor farmers' livelihoods vulnerable and might in turn discourage the farmers to continue farming.

14. Lack of quality seeds and fertilizer affect agricultural production. Though subsidized inputs are provided for the benefit of the small farmers, and government has already taken various positive steps to ease the process of getting subsidized inputs from the resource poor farmers, targeted farmers are often deprived of the benefits due to a lack of proper functioning of the governance system. A study⁸ conducted in 2010 reveals that although urea is strictly to be sold by the designated dealers of the own unions only, more than 17 percent of it is put on the open market (an indication of leakage in the fertilizer distribution system). Though various policy directions have been given to the private commercial banks to increase the flow of credit to farming activities, progress is slow, and access to credit is one of the biggest constraints to farmers because of inadequate and inefficient financial institutions in the rural areas.

15. Women play important roles as producers of food, managers of natural resources, income earners, and caretakers of household food and nutrition security but women's access to and control over land are still confined. A study finds that men own 96% of land where women own the remaining 4% of land⁹. Consequently a significant number of women farmers in Bangladesh are unable to access fertilizer, cash assistance and other government subsidies intended for farmers, because of the lack of the land ownership¹⁰.

16. Notwithstanding that the recent policy documents¹¹ that set the programs for crop diversification and for development of fisheries and livestock sector, these subsectors' growth pace is slow due to various challenges including a lack of adequate resource allocation and institutional capacity of respective the

⁶ According to Population and Housing Census 2011: as on 15 March 2011, total population of Bangladesh is 14, 97, 72,364 and project population on 16 July 2012 is 15, 25, 18,015. Population growth rate is 1.37%

⁷ Bangladesh Rice Farmers Demand Higher Purchase Price for New Crop Boro Paddy(Oryza News on May 22,2012)/ The Daily Star, 14 September 2012

⁸ A Quantitative Analysis of Fertilizer Demand and Subsidy Policy in Bangladesh(Manob Sakti Unnayan Kendro), December 2010

⁹ Masud Ali, AKM Mustaque Ali Ratan Sarkar(2005),Agrarian living beyond corporate cage: Peasant's paper on trade and Globalization; INCIDIN Bangladesh, Dhaka.

¹⁰ <http://www.irinnews.org/Report/93851/BANGLADESH-Bureaucratic-hitch-leaves-women-farmers-high-and-dry>: The problem, according to Sharmind Neelormi, an associate economics professor at Jahangir Nagar University in Dhaka who has studied gender trends in farming, and others, is that the Agriculture Input Assistance Card (AIAC) programme requires eligible cardholders to own land

¹¹ Country Investment Plan for Fisheries Development(2010-2015), Road Map to Country Investment Plan for Agriculture, Food Security and Nutrition with Proper Livestock Resource management, and Country Investment Plan for

government agencies, and a lack of policy incentives to encourage local private investors¹². And wide gap exists between the current productions and demand for milk, meat, and eggs¹³.

17. Despite the critical importance of agriculture for increasing economic growth and ensuring food security, investment in agriculture is found to be falling much shorter than the needs. Experience of the past few years indicate that the share of agricultural expenditure in the total budget has been on a declining trend since FY2010. Similarly, budgetary amount of subsidies available to agriculture and food security is also declining (**Annex IV: Table 3 & 4**).

Food Access:

18. Recent official statistics Household Income and Expenditure Survey (HIES) 2010 (Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics (BBS), 2011), shows the progress in reducing the poverty rate (31.5%) in 2010 from 56% in 1991-1992. However, since this HIES reports poverty estimates using only the Cost of Basic Needs (CBN) method and not the Direct Calorie Intake (DCI) method, this poverty estimate does not directly show the food security status.

19. The Millennium Development Goals Bangladesh Progress Report 2011 acknowledges that despite progress in poverty eradication, attaining food security and nutritional wellbeing still remains a huge challenge. Still, a large number of people remain unable to access food in the quantity, diversity and regularity required for a food secure life. According to the Welfare Monitoring Survey 2009(A BBS Survey), 39.8% of the population thinks that they are food insecure. The households reported that food crisis is a long term phenomenon for them (80.8%) and the main reasons behind this are less income (59.6%) and a lack of agricultural land (44.8%). Labor Force Survey 2010, carried out by BBS, shows a low employment rate that is 59.3 % of the population with low participation of women (36%). Currently, women's agricultural wages are 41% less than men¹⁴, the difference of which is still high. The Millennium Development Goals, Bangladesh Progress Report 2011 reveals the increasing income inequality between the rich and the poor¹⁵. Findings of HIES 2010 reveal that the incidence of rural poverty is higher than that of urban poverty (**Annex V**) and poverty ranged from 26% in Chittagong division to 46% in Rangpur division.

20. There is a significant difference in agricultural daily wages for male and female labors. This situation is especially crucial for poor female-headed households who have no means of income other than day-labor. Though movement in real wages determines the affordability to those who are employed, the benefits of the increased wages are seasonal and last only for five months during the harvest and planting seasons. Regional disparities exist in the proportion of the population with less than 2,122 kcal/day. Bangladesh household food security Nutrition Assessment 2008-09 reported that populations living in Barisal and Rajshahi divisions had worse (lower) food consumption scores in comparison with other divisions (**Annex VI**). The survey also found that female headed households and households in rural areas are more food insecure compared to their respective counterparts.

12 National Food Policy Plan of Action and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012

13 Zahurul Karim, Khan Shahidul Huque, Md. Golam Hussain, Zulfikar Ali, and Mosharraf Hossain, Growth and Development Potential of Livestock and Fisheries in Bangladesh, Prepared for the Bangladesh Food Security Investment Forum May 2010: A comparison of projected supply and demand shows that there will be a shortfall of about 1 million metric tons (mt) of fish in 2015 under a high-demand growth scenario

¹⁴ Zhang, X., S. Rashid, K. Ahmad, V. Muller, H. Lemma, S. Belal and A. Ahmed (2012) Rising Wages and Poverty Reduction in Bangladesh Background paper prepared for the World Bank Poverty Assessment Report on Bangladesh, IFPRI

¹⁵ MDGs Bangladesh progress report 2011, page 17

21. Food price hike and price instability have become a matter of grave concern particularly for the low income and fixed income people (**Annex VII**)¹⁶. The greatest impact of price hike is on poor households whose food to non-food shares are proportionately larger in household spending (68% of total household expenditures in the poorest 5% of households go on food compared to 33% in the richest 5% of households)¹⁷. Given the instability of food prices, the Government has reinstated Open Market Sales (OMS) to stabilize consumer prices during the lean seasons. However, the quantity distributed through OMS has generally not exceeded 1% of total market supply suggesting that the impact in terms of price stabilization is quite low relative to the relief provided to poor urban consumers, though in 2010/11, the distribution reached almost 3% of total supply with significant effects in containing price inflation observed between late 2010 and the first part of 2012¹⁸. If the present trend continues, urban poor will be affected due to possible food price hike, poor wage and lack of access to nutritious food and safe drinking water.

22. Bangladesh has wide coverage of social safety net (SSN) programs to tackle the hunger of poor people. Overall coverage of households benefiting from at least one SSN increased from 13.0% of households in 2005 to 24.6% in 2010 (HIES 2010). In recent years, SSN spending has soared to a staggering US\$4 Billion per annum, competing with spending in development projects under annual development plans. According to Zohir et al., close to 70 Government safety net programs are currently scattered across more than 15 different Government agencies. In addition, a vast number of programs – reaching into the thousands – are being operated by an extensive network of NGOs and development partners¹⁹.

23. Whilst this represents substantial progress within five years, the coverage rate is still below the proportion of households that are poor. Challenges associated with the targeting, administration, monitoring and transparency of safety nets are widely discussed. Lack of coordination among the different agencies both within the government and beyond is a major constraint for improved achievement. Moreover, though the social safety nets help safeguard the food rights of millions of people, this is not implemented within a rights-based framework of entitlements, accountability and redressal.

24. To promote agricultural marketing and to improve the legal framework around agricultural price information, agribusiness and marketing, a proposed legislation titled Agribusiness Management Act (2011), is in the pipeline. These also include other initiatives to improve physical access to market facilities under country investment plan²⁰. However, the weak governance of the implementing Ministry and other local institutions remains one the major threats to achieve this objective²¹. Though domestic procurement program has an important role to play in providing price support and production incentives

¹⁶ AAM Badrul Hasan and Sharifa Khan,(2011), Food Security of the Net Food Importing Developing Countries(NFDIS) in the context of WTO Negotiations.

¹⁷ Food Policy Action Plan and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012, page no.21/ Based on the BBS HIES 2010.

¹⁸ Food Policy Action Plan and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012

¹⁹ <http://www.nfpcsp.org/agridrupal/sites/default/files/Working%20together%20for%20better%20safety.pdf>

²⁰ Food Policy Action Plan and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012, page no.55

²¹ Oxfam Publication: A review of Bangladesh Country Investment(CIP): Issues and Challenges.

to the farmers, lack of accountability and appropriate monitoring at different tiers of the program holds back the efficiency of the program²².

25. Although the domestic production of rice shows a surplus, the country has to depend on international markets for most other essential food items which include wheat, sugar, pulse, onion, turmeric etc. As an importing country, any changes in the policy and restrictions on the exporting countries immediately affect the domestic markets in soaring domestic prices. Moreover, global price increases also result in increasing the price in local markets as experienced during 2007-08 global price crisis²³. Due to the loss of production in some food exporting countries due to adverse weather events, experts are apprehending for the crisis like 2007-2008²⁴, Bangladesh as an importing country is likely to be a victim of the situation, if appropriate precautionary policy measures are not taken at national and global level.

26. **International Cooperation:** To establish a sustainable food security regime, indigenous supply has to be the main contributor to the supply side, leaving the rest to import. But, as an economically stressed developing country, Bangladesh cannot be expected to meet the challenges of upholding the right to food on their own, especially in the wake of crop losses in years from unfavorable weather conditions. International cooperation is required in this regard both in terms of technological and financial assistance to achieve the progressive realization of the right to food in Bangladesh. On the other hand, as an importing country, Bangladesh's food security situation is affected by the unjust trade policies and practices at global level such as trade barriers/restriction by food exporting countries, increasing alternative uses of food for the purposes like producing bio-fuels, calls for reforms in the global trade policies, and practices to ensure adequate food supply even in times of crisis.

Food Utilization:

27. To improve the food utilization status various government initiatives are in place, such as community-based nutrition programs, awareness on nutritional values, developing Food Safety and Quality Policy, and a National Food Safety Emergency Response Plan. However, compared to food availability, progress in food utilization in terms of food safety and nutritional values is upsetting. Currently, about 70% of caloric needs are fulfilled by cereals (62% by rice alone), against a desirable maximum of 60%²⁵. Though Bangladesh has made progress in reducing underweight prevalence rates, with the exception of Khulna division, all of Bangladesh's administrative divisions had underweight rates over 30 percent; a threshold used by the World Health Organization (WHO) as indicative of a 'very high severity situation'²⁶. In the Welfare survey 2009, the households who reported food insecurity mentioned that they manage such crisis by starving (54.3%), loan/borrowing (49.2%) and reducing favorite food (49.3%) and taking less food (39.3%) which signify poor food consumption level.

28. In a 2010 nutrition survey by Helen Keller International (HKI), the Dhaka-based BRAC University, and the Bangladesh Bureau of Statistics, an estimated 45 percent of children under five were found too

²² The Bangladesh Development Studies, Vol. XXXIII, March-June 2010, Nos. 1 & 2, The Right to Food: Bangladesh Perspectives, QUAZI SHAHABUDDIN* P. 117

²³ BIDS Policy Brief, Input Prices, Subsidies and Farmers' Incentives, M. Asaduzzaman, Quazi Shahabuddin, Uttam Kumar Deb and Steve Jones (May 2009): In 2007 and 2008, Bangladesh experienced unprecedented rises and sharp falls in the prices of oil, fertilizer and food. A striking feature of this volatility was that while prices took many months to build up to their peaks in mid-2008, the downturn was very rapid, with prices tumbling by the end of 2008.

²⁴ <http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/business-19193390>

²⁵ National Food Policy Plan of Action and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012, p-16

²⁶ MDGs Bangladesh Progress Report 2011, page 21

short for their age group (stunted), a sign of vitamin and mineral deficiency. Six out of 10 households in Bangladesh - including some 10 million children - did not have access to sufficient, safe and nutritious food in 2010, according to the food security and nutrition survey by HKI and its Bangladeshi partners²⁷. Growth retardation, an outcome of chronic under nutrition, is widespread, affecting almost one in two of the country's 17 million children below five years of age (Household Food Security and Nutrition Assessment (HFSNA 2009). According to Bangladesh Demographic and Health Survey (BDHS, 2011), forty-one percent (41%) of all children younger than 5 years old suffer from stunted growth while 16 % are wasted. The combination of stunting and wasting causes thirty-six percent (36%) of all under-5 children to suffer from being underweight (BDHS 2011). It may be noted that for a country like Bangladesh, food intake quality and awareness on nutrition both are important to address malnutrition of mother and children.

29. Notwithstanding the existence of various state laws and institutions such as, Bangladesh Pure Food (Amendment Act) 2005, Consumer Rights Protection Act 2009, Bangladesh Standard Testing Institute (BSTI) food safety is another major concern in Bangladesh. Punishment provisions under the Pure Food Law are minimal and cannot stop the offenders from continuing their illegal activities²⁸. Besides, because of the procedural hindrances, lack of accountability, lack of monitoring systems as well as the lack of awareness among the consumers about their rights²⁹, the Consumer Rights Protection Act 2009 cannot effectively ensure consumers' right to safe food.

30. The National Food Policy Plan of Action and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012 pointed out that only 64 out of 143 enlisted foods are certified. Food adulteration with poisonous chemicals has reached a dangerous proportion posing serious health hazards in the country. Basic food items on the market like rice, fish, fruits, vegetables, and sweetmeats are adulterated with hazardous chemicals in an indiscriminate manner³⁰.

VI. Exclusion and Vulnerability:

31. The findings of a socio-economic baseline survey conducted by a nongovernmental research organization in the CHT showed the acutely disadvantaged situation of the population of the CHT, and particularly that of the indigenous peoples, as compared with the rest of the country³¹. The report showed, among others, that eighteen per cent of the total population of the region was dependent upon farming/cultivation for their livelihood and about 22 per cent of indigenous households lost their lands. The socio-economic status of most indigenous communities in the plains, particularly in the north-western Rajshahi administrative divisions, is known generally to be even worse than that of indigenous communities in the CHT. In a recent baseline survey (2011) on the human rights situation in Bangladesh conducted by NHRC, the respondents from the indigenous communities reported that lack of equal opportunities for employment, and land disputes are major problems facing by them which indicates the vulnerability to food security of the indigenous people of the country³². Stakeholders agreed that as exclusion and inequality is a structural phenomenon,

27 DHAKA, 22 December 2011 (IRIN)

28 Anika Hossain, What Your Children Eat, A weekly Publication of the Daily Star, Vol 14, Issue 796, September 28, 2012

29 <http://lawlib.wlu.edu/lexopus/works/297-1.pdf>

30 Thursday, Aug 11, 2011/ The Daily Star/Asia News Network

31 Country Technical Notes on Indigenous Peoples' Issues: BANGLADESH, Submitted by: Raja Devasish Roy Date: March 2010/ Human Development Research Centre (Abul Barkat et al), Socio-economic Baseline Survey of Chittagong Hill Tracts, Chittagong Hill Tracts Development Facility, UNDP, Bangladesh, IDB Bhaban, Sher-e-Bangla Nagar, Dhaka 1207, 2009.

32 Food Policy Action Plan Monitoring Report 2012, p.19

32. Depending on the agro ecological base adversity, region based food insecurity also exists. Such as, early flood or flash floods affect the rice production in Haor³³ areas. Continuous rodent and pig attacks on crops in Chittagong Hill Tracts area and crop damage due to excessive rainfall, ban on jhum (shifting) crop cultivation, erode the access to food and income of the region³⁴. Food Security Strategies of The People Living in Haor Areas: Status and Prospects (October 2010) explored that over two-fifths of the survey households suffered from normal food insecurity, about one-third from moderate food insecurity and near one-fifth from severe food insecurity. Such vulnerable situations require special attention and priority consideration for victims of natural disasters, people living in disaster-prone areas and other specially disadvantaged groups.

VII. Policy coherence and implementation progress:

33. There are quite a large number of policy instruments related to agriculture, food security and rural development (**Annex VIII**). While these documents are complementary to each other, in some cases they contradict each other. In some cases, there are repetitions of the same policies too. Besides, due to the involvement of multiple ministries lack of coordination hinders the effective progress³⁵. The NFP, PoA and CIP could provide pathway both for a unifying policy framework and a coordinating institutional mechanism. Election manifesto of present elected government of Bangladesh covers a range of indicators, though at the implementation level progress are limited. As a SAARC Country, Bangladesh is also responsible to deliver on SDGs besides MDGs targets.

34. CIP, as a five-year investment plan made for food and agriculture for Bangladesh, does not carry any major discrepancy in terms of policy, planning and strategies between these documents and is fully mainstreamed into the 6th Five Year Plan. However, a greater degree of inconsistencies are found at the implementation level (**Annex IX, Review of Bangladesh Country Investment Plan (CIP): Issues and Challenges**). The National Food Policy Plan of Action and Country Investment Plan Monitoring Report 2012 reveals slow and uneven implementation progress, as indicated by a delivery of just 51% of the budget available for the financial year 2010/11, but impressive increase of the funding of food security and nutrition investments (+ 2.2 Billion USD in 2010/11 for a total of 5.2 billion financed).

VIII. Recommendations:

35. Adopting a legal framework on right to food, and introduce right based approach to programing on food security for progressive realization of the right to adequate food;
36. Adopt National Agriculture Policy with necessary revisions for ensuring coherence with all agriculture and food security and nutrition policy framework and ensure coherence and efficient coordination among all the relevant implementing agencies;
37. Take measures to strengthen agricultural research works with a particular focus on agro ecological peculiarities and climate resilient crop varieties;
38. Ensure a strong and frequently updated information system on agriculture, food security and nutrition for accurate projection on the need of the farmers, and for proper planning and monitoring; Strengthen the progress monitoring process by involving a multi stakeholder participatory process;

³³ Haor is a bowl shape seasonal wetland with perennial water bodies found in North East Bangladesh and Indian State Assam and Tripura

³⁴ Bangladesh Food Security Monitoring Bulletin, Issue No.8, Jan-Mar 2012

³⁵ Comprehensive Agrarian Reform Program (2009), Campaign for Sustainable Rural Livelihood.

39. Ensure adequate subsidy for the agricultural inputs and strengthen the distribution system to prevent any form of irregularity in the system. Take measures to strengthen the capacity of the relevant govt. institutions such as, Bangladesh Agricultural Development Corporation(BADC), Department of Agricultural Extension(DAE) and to empower them to ensure timely and quality services required for the farmers; Ensure incessant initiatives on storage, agro processing, and marketing in adequate and efficient manner;
40. Scale up investment to modernize the functioning of state-run TCB, including opening up its branches in different divisions of the country and strengthen the market monitoring to stabilize the food prices;
41. Increase the financial investments in the fisheries and livestock sectors as part of comprehensive agriculture, take measures to enhance the capacity of the implementing agencies of these sectors, and update/review existing policies on the livestock sector to encourage private investment;
42. Update land use policy and ensure its proper implementation to stop using agriculture land for non-agriculture activities (urbanisation, industrialisation, setting up house, market etc) following FAO voluntary guideline on land;
43. Ensure right based approach in the development of Social Protection Strategy currently under development and adopt a unified policy on right based Social Safety Net or Social Protection programs linking with long term development programs on agriculture, food security and nutrition;
44. Consider emerging challenges affecting food security like climate change, urbanization, price volatility and financial market instability in designing and implementing food security initiatives; and ensure better coordination among the existing programs;
45. Take appropriate legal and administrative steps to ensure land rights of the indigenous people while recognizing traditional rights to land of the indigenous people living in the hill tracts or other forest areas;
46. Adopt community based nutrition programs targeting both rural and urban area following a life cycle approach and ensure that such interventions are consistent with local ecosystems and prioritize local solutions and are consistent with the objective of moving towards sustainable diets;
47. Massive awareness raising among the consumers on the food safety issues and strengthen the legal and the regulatory regime of consumer protection in the country along with strong monitoring systems; ensure better coordination between food safety inspection and enforcement agencies;
48. Submit long due initial and periodic report on ICESCR to the Committee on ICESCR and take measures to implement the recommendations of the Committee; Complying with CEDAW obligations, take legal, administrative measures to end discrimination against women and ensure women's equal rights(right to land and other economic property);
49. Secure pro farmers position in negotiation in WTO to protect the rights of the small and marginalized farmers as far as agriculture is concerned; and takes effective measures that agriculture products get the duty free and quota free market access to the international markets;
50. Take effective steps to set up regional and international virtual food banks with the commitments of food availability to countries stressed by food insecurity and furthering the process of making such arrangement operational, in cases where such arrangement has already been made, for example, SAARC Food Bank.
51. Include the food security concerns in the agriculture related trade negotiations from a food security perspective; introduce new rules and disciplines to prevent export restrictions/barriers by food exporting countries and ensure continuing food exports to the Least Developed Countries(LDCs) at affordable prices even during the crisis period;

52. Increase Official Development Assistance (ODA) and ensure that developed countries/development partners realize their commitments of ODA for the development of agriculture and food security. This can be followed up under MDGs Framework and upcoming Post 2015 process besides ongoing process like COP.

/End/

Annex 1

Description of CSRL and Oxfam:

Campaign for Sustainable and Rural Livelihoods (CSRL) Bangladesh: Campaign for Sustainable Rural Livelihoods (CSRL) is an alliance of 250 local-national-international development and civil society organizations, active in Bangladesh. Formed in September 2007, CSRL aims to ensure sustainable rural livelihoods in Bangladesh by focusing on agriculture, climate change and trade policies and practices. Besides performing at local and national level, this alliance is now also playing a significant role at the international level for protecting the public interest of Bangladesh.

Oxfam: Oxfam is an international confederation of 17 organizations networked together in more than 90 countries, as part of a global movement for change, to build a future free from the injustice of poverty. Oxfam's involvement in Bangladesh began with Oxfam GB's assistance to the refugees during the 1971 war for Bangladesh's independence.

This stakeholders' report has been drafted by the Secretariat of Campaign for Sustainable Rural Livelihood with the inputs from CSRL partners and Steering Committee Members.

Annex II

Ratification of core human rights treaties

Human Rights Treaty	Ratification / Accession (a)	Reservations and Declarations
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)	6 September 2000 (a)	Declarations: <u>Article 10 (rights during loss of liberty)</u> , <u>Article 11 (Imprisonment for inability to fulfill contractual obligation)</u> , <u>Article 14 (no trial in absentia)</u> : Reservation: <u>Article 14 (no trial in absentia)</u>
Optional Protocol to ICCPR (individual complaints procedure)	-	
Second Optional Protocol to ICCPR (abolishing the death penalty)	-	
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)	5 October 1998 (a)	<u>Article 1 (right to self-determination)</u> : <u>Articles 2 (realization of rights) and 3 (gender equality)</u> : <u>Articles 7 (conditions of work) and 8 (trade union rights)</u> : <u>Articles 10 (family rights) and 13 (right to education)</u> :
Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights New York, 10 December 2008 Not yet in force	-	
International Convention on the		

Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD)	11 June 1979 (a)	
Declaration under art.14 ICERD allowing for individual complaints		Acceptance of amendment to art. 8 (6): Receipt of declaration on art. 14
Convention against Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (CAT)	5 October 1998 (a)	Reservation: <u>Article 14 Para 1</u>
Declaration under art.22 CAT allowing for individual complaints		Receipt of declaration on art. 22
Optional Protocol to CAT (allowing in-country inspections of places of detention)		
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW)	6 November 1984 (a)	Reservation: Articles 2, [...] and 16 (1) (c) Article 2- Principle of non discrimination and elimination of discrimination against women Articles 2 16 (1) (c)- Elimination of discrimination against women in all matters relating to marriage and family relations, in particular the same rights and responsibilities during marriage and its dissolution.
Optional Protocol to CEDAW allowing for individual complaints	6 September 2000	Declaration: Article 10 (1) thereof that it would not undertake the obligations arising out of Articles 8 and 9 of the said Optional Protocol.
Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)	3 August 1990	Reservations: <u>Article 14 (freedom of thought, conscience and religion):</u> "[The Government of Bangladesh] ratifies the Convention with a reservation to article 14, paragraph 1. <u>Article 21 (adoption):</u> "Also article 21 would apply subject to the existing laws and practices in Bangladesh."
Optional Protocol to CRC on the involvement of children in armed conflict	6 September 2000	
Optional Protocol to CRC on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography	6 September 2000	
International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and members of	24 August 2011	

Their Families (CMW)		
Declaration under art.77 CMW allowing for individual complaints		
Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities New York, 13 December 2006	9 May 2007(S) 30 November 2007(R)	
Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities New York, 13 December 2006	12 May 2008(a)	
International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance New York, 20 December 2006	-	

Annex III

Structure of distribution of agricultural land holding (1983-2008)

Items	1983-84	1996	2008
Distribution of farm holdings by size:			
Small (<1.0 ha)	70.3%	80.0%	84.2%
Medium (1.0-3.0 ha)	24.7%	17.6%	14.2%
Large (>3.0 ha)	4.9%	2.5%	1.6%

Source: BBS Census of Agriculture 2008, National Series, Volume 1/ Food Action Plan Monitoring Report 2012;

Annex IV

Table 3:

Ministry wise budget allocation for agriculture and rural development (combined of development and non development allocation)

Ministry/ FY	FY 2012-13	FY 2011-12 (revised)	FY2011-12	FY2010-11
Agriculture	8,911	9,260	7,406	8,438
Ministry of fishery and animal resources	948	931	977	774
Ministry of water resources	2,892	2,261	2,228	2,040
Rural development and cooperative division	1,112	1,047	802	630

Table 4: Agricultural subsidy during the five fiscal years (in Crore Taka)

Fiscal Year	FY 2007-08	FY 2008-09	FY 2009-10	FY 2010-11	FY 2011-12
Agriculture subsidy	2250	4285	3600	4006	4500

Total Subsidy	4200	6717	6989	7662	9286
Agriculture subsidy as % of total subsidy	54	64	52	52	48

Source: Ministry of Finance (MoF)-<http://www.mof.gov.bd>

Subsidy trend in last 2 fiscal years

FY	Amount
2012-13	TK. 6,000 crore Taka
2011-12(revised)	TK. 6,500 crore Taka
2011-12	TK. 4500 Crore Taka

Source: budget statements

Annex V

Head Count Rates of Incidence of Poverty (CBN Method), 1991-92 to 2010

Years of HIES	Upper Poverty Line			Lower Poverty Line		
	National	Rural	Urban	National	Rural	Urban
2010	31.5	35.2	17.6	21.3	21.1	7.7
2005	40.0	43.8	28.4	25.1	28.6	14.6

Using data of HIES 2010

Annex VI

Food Insecurity by Geographic and Gender Status (percent)

National	Average	25
Area	Rural	27
	Urban	17
Division	Barisal	26
	Chittagong	25
	Dhaka	20
	Khulna	25
	Rajshahi	31
	Sylhet	24
Sex of household head	Male	23
	Female	38

Source: BHFSNA 2008-09, WFP, UNICEF, IPHN/ MDGs Bangladesh Progress Report 2011(table 1.6)

Annex VII

Average price of some essential food items price/kg

Item	Price 11.01.2006	Price 11.01.2007	Price 9.03.2011	% of change between 2006 & 2011	% of change between 2007 & 11
1	2	3	4	5	6
Rice(Coarse)	17.50	18.50	34.00	83.78	94.29
Wheat Flour	19.50	25.50	31.00	21.57	58.97
Soya bin Oil	50.50	65.00	105.00	61.54	107.92
Pulm Oil	40.50	51.00	94.00	84.31	132.10
Pulse(Lentil)	48.00	65.00	72.00	10.77	50.00
Sugar	47.50	36.50	57.00	56.16	20.00
Potato	14.50	13.00	8.00	-38.46	-44.83
Onion	20.00	18.00	20.00	11.11	0.00
Milk Powder	293.00	347.00	420.00	21.04	43.34
Salt	12	13	15	15.38	25.00

Source: Trading Corporation of Bangladesh, Ministry of Commerce, 09 March 2011/

Annex VIII

Policies related to agriculture

Policy	Ministry
<i>Crops Sub-sector</i>	
1. National Agricultural Policy (NAP) 1999	Agricultural Ministry
2. New Agricultural Extension Policy (NAEP) 1996	Agricultural Ministry
3. DAE Strategy Plan 1999-2002	Agricultural Ministry
4. Agricultural Extension Manual 1999	Agricultural Ministry
5. Seed Policy 1993	Agricultural Ministry
6. Seed Law 1997	Agricultural Ministry
7. Co-ordinated Pest Management Policy 2002	Agricultural Ministry
8. National Agricultural Work Plan	Agricultural Ministry
9. Effective Policy Brief 2004	Agricultural Ministry
10. National Jute Policy 2002	Ministry of Jute
<i>Non-Crop Sub-sector</i>	
11. National Livestock Policy and Work Plan 2005	Ministry of Fisheries and Livestock
12. National Fisheries Policy and Action Plan 1998	Ministry of Fisheries and Livestock
13. National Forest Policy 1994	Ministry of Forest and Environment
<i>Cross-Cutting Policies</i>	
14. National Land Use Policy	Ministry of Land
15. National Water Policy	Water Resources Ministry
16. Environment Policy 1992 and Implementation Programme	Ministry of Forest and Environment
17. National Food Policy 2006	Food Ministry

18. National Rural Development Policy 2001	Rural Development and Cooperative Ministry
19. Agriculture and Rural Development parts (2008) of Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper-2 (2009-2011)	Planning Commission, Planning Ministry
20. Export Import Policy 2006-2009	Commerce Ministry
21. National Economic Policies	Ministry of Finance

Annex IX

Policy Consistency Matrix

Area of Intervention for Food Security	Perspective Plan	Sixth Five Year Plan	CIP	Budget FY2010-11 & FY2011-12	Comments/ Suggestions
<i>Food production</i>	Highly stressed to achieve self-sufficiency in food production by the year 2015	Highly stressed to achieve self-sufficiency in food production by 2015	Zero dependency on food import	The two budgets lack consistency. The goals are not clear. In the budget of FY2010-11, it was announced that self-sufficiency on food production will be achieved by 2012; the budget of the current fiscal said that self-sufficiency on food will be achieved by 2013.	Inconsistency between short and long term policy and plan strategies may weaken the goal of achieving food self-sufficiency in the country within a stipulated time.
<i>Agriculture research and extension</i>	Investment on R&D Stressed	Stressed and identified a tentative priority research area, and formulated strategies for extension services	Top priority is given with an investment proposal of US\$ 1 billion	There is no new allocation to carry out agriculture research and development; no initiative to modernize agriculture extension services in the country which is very important for better agriculture health.	Inconsistency remains in planning and actual implementation.
<i>Impacts of climate change on agriculture production</i>	Highly stressed	No strategy to tackle climate change impacts on agriculture	Proposed adaptive measures to tackle climate change	A sum of TK700 crore is allocated in each of the last two fiscals (also in FY2009-10); yet no fund is allocated to	Inconsistency remains both in planning and actual implementation

		production	impacts	the MoA to tackle the impacts of CC on agriculture.	
<i>Productivity and technology</i>	Highly stressed	Devised strategies	Stressed through R & D programs	No emphasis has been given to increase agriculture productivity and technological innovation	Inconsistency remains both in planning and actual implementation
<i>Regional intervention</i>	Coastal zone, Sylhet & chars in the munga affected areas got priority in crop sector development plan.	Coastal zone, Sylhet & char areas in the munga affected areas got priority in crop sector development plan.	Stressed is given in southern part of the country only	Some attention has been given on Aila affected southern region of Bangladesh.	Inconsistency; tendency to have ex-post responses; regional intervention should be focused on agro-ecological zone base intervention.
<i>Irrigation</i>	Highly stressed	Devised targets and comprehensive strategies	Proposed the largest investment program	Budget allocation is well below the targets set in CIP.	Lack of resources could be the key constraint; targets may not achieve because of lack of fund, and inefficiency and poor governance of WDB
<i>Fisheries & Livestock</i>	Highly stressed	Devised strategies	Investment plan for next five years has been doubled up compared to the past five years.	Budget allocation is well below the projected amount as in CIP.	Lack of resources could be the key constraint
<i>Rural development and</i>	Emphasis has been given on powerful and autonomous	As usual strategies are	Investment program has given on road	Relatively less emphasis is given on rural development	Decentralization of local government and weak governance

<i>institutions:</i>	local Governance	proposed	connectivity	and rural institutions.	of rural institutions continued to remain in all planning and policy documents.
<i>Employment generation</i>	Highly stressed	Proposed strategies are as usual, employment in non-farm sector is stressed	No specific program for employment generation.	Budgetary measures are as usual	Objective of access to food may not be achieved due to lack of employment and income opportunities
<i>Rural Credit</i>	Stress is been given on reform and innovation to improve credit market opportunities for the rural poor and to increase the efficacy of rural finance.	Micro credit is stressed	No program has been taken accordingly	No initiative has been taken to increase the flow of finance in rural economy.	Markets could not be developed, if the flow of money circulation is not increased sufficiently.
<i>Food price stabilization</i>	Vaguely mentioned	No specific strategies	Public food management system is being stressed.	No specific measures has been taken	Government has lost its control over food market and seriously failed to control it
<i>Social safety net (SSN) programmes</i>	Stressed, but as usual	Strategies are as usual	Stress is been given for institutional and capacity development for more effective SSN programs	Budgetary measures are as usual	Region specific new integrated SSN is required which should be linked with economically productive activities
<i>Natural</i>	There is no	Provide	Not taken	No specific initiative	Increasing access

<i>resources management and their access to poor</i>	direction.	some directions for natural resources management and its access to poor	into consideration.	has been taken	to natural resources for rural poor is essential for reducing poverty and food vulnerability. Thus all the planning documents should give high importance on it
<i>Improve nutritional status</i>	Stressed to keep it below 15 per cent by 2021, but terms it challenging	There is no specific target; strategies are as usual, in the case of health, population and nutrition together	Target is to reduce malnourished people to 17.5 per cent by 2015. Community-based program is proposed	Little initiatives are been taken.	Strategies in SFYP and CIP are inconsistent.