



General Assembly

Distr.: General
16 June 2010

Original: English

Human Rights Council
Fifteenth session
Agenda item 6
Universal Periodic Review

Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review*

Spain

* Previously issued under document symbol A/HRC/WG.6/8/L.5. The annex to the present report is circulated as received.

Contents

	<i>Paragraphs</i>	<i>Page</i>
Introduction.....	1–4	3
I. Summary of the proceedings of the review process.....	5–83	3
A. Presentation by the State under review.....	5–16	3
B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review.....	17–83	5
II. Conclusions and/or recommendations.....	84–88	12
Annex		
Composition of the delegation.....		23

Introduction

1. The Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review, established in accordance with Human Rights Council resolution 5/1, held its eighth session from 3 to 14 May 2010. The review of Spain was held at the 5th meeting, on 5 May 2010. The delegation of Spain was headed by the Secretary of State for Constitutional and Parliamentary Affairs, José de Francisco. At its 9th meeting, held on 7 May 2010, the Working Group adopted the report on Spain.
2. On 7 September 2009, the Human Rights Council selected the following group of rapporteurs (troika) to facilitate the review of Spain: Chile, India and South Africa.
3. In accordance with paragraph 15 of the annex to resolution 5/1, the following documents were issued for the review of Spain:
 - (a) A national report submitted/written presentation made in accordance with paragraph 15 (a) (A/HRC/WG.6/8/ESP/1);
 - (b) A compilation prepared by the Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (OHCHR) in accordance with paragraph 15 (b) (A/HRC/WG.6/8/ESP/2);
 - (c) A summary prepared by OHCHR in accordance with paragraph 15 (c) (A/HRC/WG.6/8/ESP/3).
4. A list of questions prepared in advance by Argentina, the Czech Republic, Denmark, Germany, the Netherlands, Norway, Slovenia, Sweden and the United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland was transmitted to Spain through the troika. Those questions are available on the extranet of the universal periodic review.

I. Summary of the proceedings of the review process

A. Presentation by the State under review

5. The delegation of Spain acknowledged that the preparation of the national report had allowed the Government to identify areas for improvement, raise awareness of pending issues and compare Spain's experience with those of other United Nations Member States. It felt persuaded that the conclusions would be useful for the improvement of existing protection mechanisms.
6. Its recent history has caused Spain to closely link the protection and development of human rights to the strengthening of democracy. Fundamental rights are a core element of the rule of law. For the current Administration, the promotion of human rights is a political priority. That commitment is apparent at the international and national levels, as well as in legislative and public policy initiatives. It is also reflected in the Government's establishment of the Ministry for Equality, which is entrusted with, among other responsibilities, the eradication of discrimination and gender-based violence.
7. At the international level, Spain has ratified most international and regional human rights treaties, including the Optional Protocol to the Convention against Torture (2006), the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the Optional Protocol thereto (2007) and the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (2009). Currently, Congress is acting to authorize the ratification of the Optional Protocol to the Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.

8. There have also been important improvements in domestic legislation, such as the recent adoption of several legal instruments, including the law against gender violence (2004), the reform of the Civil Code to permit same-sex marriage (2005), the organic law for effective gender equality (2007) and the law on personal autonomy and attention to persons in a dependency situation (2006).

9. Regarding human rights policies, the delegation highlighted the adoption of the Human Rights Plan of 2008, which is based on equality, non-discrimination and integration, and includes human rights guarantees. Additionally, a follow-up commission has been established.

10. Spain's commitment to the Millennium Development Goals is reflected in the ever-increasing percentage of gross domestic product (GDP) allocated to development cooperation. This year, Spanish cooperation should reach 0.51 per cent of GDP, and the Government remains committed to achieving the goal of 0.7 per cent of GDP. The delegation stressed that Spain is aware of the importance of the work of the Human Rights Council to consolidate and promote human rights, and referred to the country's contribution to the Office of the High Commissioner.

11. Immigrants constitute 10 per cent of the Spanish population. Spain is unequivocally committed to formulating a body of public policy on integration based on an intercultural model and dialogue among cultures.

12. Spain's presidency of the European Union (EU) has prompted actions to further involve EU institutions in the promotion of human rights. Thus, Spain is striving to achieve EU ratification of the European Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.

13. The delegation indicated that Spain is the European State that has suffered most from terrorism to date. Spain has never renounced the rule of law or international law in its response to terrorist acts.

14. Concerning the preparation of the report, the role of civil society was acknowledged by the delegation. The inclusion of economic, social and cultural rights issues was only one example of the positive input from civil society representatives.

15. Since the issuance of the national report, there have been a number of noteworthy developments that assist in gaining an up-to-date perspective on the human rights situation. In March 2010, the Official Bulletin published two instruments of ratification. The first one related to the Convention on Cluster Munitions (March 19), and the second pertained to Protocol No. 13 to the Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, concerning the abolition of the death penalty in all circumstances. Furthermore, on 24 March in Geneva, the President launched an initiative to establish an international commission against capital punishment. In addition, on 30 March, the Government adopted a report on the measures necessary to bring Spanish legislation into line with the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the Optional Protocol thereto. The Organic Law on Sexual and Reproductive Health and Voluntary Pregnancy Interruption was also adopted in March 2010.

16. Before concluding its introductory statement, the delegation mentioned the fact that, on 29 January, the current Administration had adopted the Programme for the Resettlement of Refugees for 2010 and that the national mechanism for preventing torture had been put in place. Following the EU pattern, the Ombudsman will be entrusted with that responsibility.

B. Interactive dialogue and responses by the State under review

17. During the interactive dialogue, 55 delegations made statements. Additional statements that could not be delivered during the interactive dialogue owing to time constraints will be posted on the extranet of the universal periodic review when available.¹ Recommendations made during the dialogue are found in section II of the present report.

18. A number of delegations acknowledged the constructive engagement of the Spanish Government with the universal periodic review mechanism and commended the delegation for the detailed and informed presentation of the report. A number of delegations noted with satisfaction the advancement of democracy, the rule of law and a national system for the promotion and protection of human rights in recent decades.

19. Nicaragua acknowledged achievements regarding normative frameworks for its public institutions and its cooperation with third countries. It regretted the fact that Spain had not played a decisive role within the European Union in tackling problems such as migration. Nicaragua remained concerned about insufficient protection of the most vulnerable sectors affected by discrimination. Nicaragua highlighted the importance of raising societal awareness about diversity and applauded the National Plan on Human Rights. Nicaragua made recommendations.

20. Colombia recognized the efforts made by Spain in its fight against terrorism, expressed its solidarity and encouraged the country to continue to be resolute in respecting human rights. It expressed its gratitude for the progress made by Spain in its fight against discrimination and in respecting the rights of same-sex couples. It welcomed the implementation of a plan to prevent gender-based violence among the foreign immigrant population. Colombia made recommendations.

21. Mexico noted that the national report reflected the progress made by Spain in the field of human rights. It noted with satisfaction the country's efforts to improve the institutional and normative framework for the protection of human rights. It congratulated Spain on having ratified most human rights treaties and on its ongoing cooperation with special procedures. It acknowledged the challenges faced by Spain in combating terrorism. Mexico made recommendations.

22. Bolivia highlighted Spain's achievements with regard to the equal treatment of men and women. It noted that much remained to be done regarding violence against women; the law on measures aimed at comprehensive protection against gender-based violence did not include irregular migrant women. Regarding equality between nationals and foreigners, Bolivia encouraged Spain to continue to implement social integration public policies. Bolivia made recommendations.

23. The Russian Federation expressed its solidarity with Spanish efforts to counter international terrorism while respecting human rights and fundamental freedoms. In relation to the rights of migrants and national minorities, and the fight against racism and xenophobia, the Russian Federation asked for additional information about the activities of the Support Fund for the Admission, Integration and Education of Immigrants. The Russian Federation made recommendations.

24. Cuba congratulated Spain on its Strategic Plan on Citizenship and Integration, but expressed concern about intolerance of and racism against migrants. It noted efforts to foster historical memory and called for further efforts to identify and exhume victims' remains and to prosecute those responsible for crimes committed during the dictatorship. It

¹ Croatia, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Botswana, Ecuador, the United Arab Emirates, Iraq.

asked about the alleged use of Spanish territory for the frequent transit of secret flights by the Central Intelligence Agency and measures taken to identify those responsible. Cuba made recommendations.

25. Brazil highlighted, inter alia, the challenges of social and economic development, the fight against discrimination and the promotion of the rights of migrant workers. It asked about policies regarding the rights of migrants and efforts to fight terrorism; measures to combat discrimination, violence and trafficking affecting children and women; policies and legal frameworks to combat discrimination; and impacts that the economic crisis might have on human rights. Brazil made recommendations.

26. Belarus congratulated Spain on its achievements in the protection of human rights. It noted the problems faced by Spain in the social and economic spheres, as well as its security concerns. Belarus was concerned about the arrival in the Canary Islands of unaccompanied child migrants who were housed in inappropriate centres. It noted Spain's efforts to combat human trafficking. It was concerned about the persistence of violence against women. Belarus made recommendations.

27. Algeria paid tribute to Spain's Ambassador to the Human Rights Council. It noted an increase in acts of intolerance and incidents of racial violence against immigrants and persons of different ethnicity or religion. It encouraged Spain to pursue its fight against human trafficking and congratulated the country on its efforts to increase development aid in order to meet the United Nations target of 0.7 per cent of GDP. Algeria made recommendations.

28. The United States of America noted that Spain continued to struggle with issues relating to unaccompanied migrant and refugee children. It expressed interest in learning about the Government's plans for the implementation of its Human Rights Plan of Action, as well as the progress made in the implementation of the Action Plan for the Development of the Roma population. The United States made recommendations.

29. Pakistan noted Spain's commitment to the promotion and protection of human rights and welcomed efforts to grant equal rights to non-nationals. It asked whether the actions taken by the Government were sufficient to address all human rights concerns in the country. It also asked the delegation to explain the specific steps it planned to take to make the Council and its mechanisms less political. Pakistan made recommendations.

30. Argentina congratulated Spain on its commitment to promoting gender equality, as well as on reforms aimed at eradicating gender-based violence and the registration of cases of violence against women. It noted that since 2006, Spain had been a member of the European Pact for Gender Equality. It encouraged Spain to reinforce legal measures to combat impunity. Argentina made recommendations.

31. Egypt noted that Spain faced challenges related to acts of intolerance and incidents of racial violence against migrants and persons of different ethnic or religious backgrounds, which were expected to continue unless there was a resolute political will to address them. Egypt made recommendations.

32. Morocco congratulated Spain on integrating immigrants and protecting the rights of migrant workers, and on its fight against racism and xenophobia. It welcomed actions to promote durable solutions for refugees. It asked what measures the Government would take to strengthen the effectiveness of its new National Strategic Plan for Children and Adolescents. It also wished clarification regarding Spain's contribution to food security globally under the third master plan for Spanish cooperation.

33. Norway stated that, despite Spain's extensive measures to promote gender equality and eliminate discrimination against women, there remained a gender wage gap and continued predominance by women in temporary or part-time work, as highlighted by

CEDAW in 2009. It stated that CEDAW had also pointed out that violence against women had actually increased, and asked what had been done to follow up on CEDAW's recommendations in that regard. Norway made recommendations.

34. The Islamic Republic of Iran expressed grave concern at the repeated use of Spanish airspace and airports by a third country for secret rendition and detention, the worrisome situation in detention centres for foreigners, discrimination against minorities and migrants based on ethnicity and religion, and the alarming phenomenon of human trafficking. It made recommendations.

35. Uruguay praised Spain's adoption of the National Plan on Human Rights and its periodic evaluation, as well as the country's good practices in preventing discrimination based on sexual orientation. While welcoming initiatives to protect the rights of migrants, Uruguay was concerned about the situation of irregular migrant workers. It highlighted the work of the Observatory against Discrimination and Racism and welcomed plans aimed at gender equality and combating violence against women. Uruguay made recommendations.

36. Denmark asked Spain for further details about its efforts related to violence against women. It also asked to Spain to elaborate on its measures to ensure that no acts of torture or ill treatment by public officials were taking place, and asked whether Spain intended to include the definition of torture in its penal code in line with its obligations under CAT. Denmark made recommendations.

37. The Czech Republic indicated that it wished to acknowledge the high percentage of women in the Government and the decisive steps taken against discrimination and violence against women. It made recommendations.

38. Palestine highlighted Spain's commitment to providing constitutional and legal guarantees for human rights protection. It noted that the report described the challenges faced by Spain. Palestine commended Spain for its efforts to promote the right to water and sanitation, steps taken to combat the death penalty, and the country's support for the peace process in the Middle East. Palestine made a recommendation.

39. Nigeria noted that Spain had yet to ratify the International Covenant on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of their Families, and asked about efforts to ratify that instrument. It expressed concern about immigrants suffering racial discrimination and asked how that problem was being tackled. Nigeria urged Spain to abide by the principles of CAT and to improve deportation procedures. Nigeria made a recommendation.

40. Bangladesh noted with appreciation Spain's legislative and policy framework for the protection of human rights. It referred to Spain's policy on migration and the challenges faced by the country in ensuring the rights of migrants, as well as reported incidents of intolerance and violence against migrants and other minorities. It also noted the situation of women, particularly migrant women and women belonging to ethnic or religious minorities. Bangladesh made recommendations.

41. Panama welcomed the comprehensive Plan to Combat the Trafficking in Human Beings for the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation. Referring to CERD and UNHCR concerns regarding ethnic minorities and foreigners, Panama asked whether Spain would adopt a national action plan against racism and xenophobia that included information about the collection of data on racist incidents as well as an adequate institutional framework. Panama made a recommendation.

42. Costa Rica welcomed Spain's four welfare-state components. It commended Spain for its good practices regarding, inter alia, the rights of foreigners, the asylum and refugee policy, the equal treatment policy and the fight against gender-based violence. It also commended Spain's contribution to the abolition of death penalty and its promotion of the

Alliance of Civilizations. It acknowledged challenges in combating terrorism. Costa Rica made recommendations.

43. Peru acknowledged Spain's commitment to the promotion of human rights, as evidenced, for example, by the adoption of a National Plan on Human Rights and the establishment of a Commission to monitor its implementation. It mentioned as a particular positive development the adoption of law 52/2007, on the right to moral reparation of victims of the dictatorship. Peru made recommendations.

44. The Netherlands expressed concern about the way in which data within the judiciary was processed and the fact that plans to update those processes had yet to yield the desired results. It also noted that, from 2002 to 2009, more than 250 police officers and prison guards had been convicted for criminal offences, including assault, and that it remained concerned about the practice of incommunicado detention. The Netherlands made recommendations.

45. Indonesia commended Spain for regarding human rights as a core element of Government policy and for its promotion of cultural dialogue through the Alliance of Civilizations. It congratulated Spain on having enacted laws granting migrants rights similar to those enjoyed by Spanish nationals. It commended the 2008 plan to combat human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Indonesia made recommendations.

46. Malaysia commended Spain for its commitment to and progress in the protection of human rights, as evidenced by the ratification of most human rights treaties. It also commended Spain for promoting the Alliance of Civilizations. While noting initiatives taken to combat racism, such as the Strategic Plan for Citizenship and Integration, it was concerned by frequent acts of intolerance and racial violence against migrants and members of ethnic minorities. Malaysia made recommendations.

47. New Zealand welcomed the adoption of plans of action addressing sex and labour exploitation, respectively. It made recommendations.

48. The United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland noted Spain's commitment to establishing an Ombudsman for the prevention of torture and asked how the Government intended to ensure that the Ombudsman had the required power and resources to act effectively. It also asked for an assessment of the success of Spain's Strategic Plan for Integration and Citizenship, as well about its initiatives to prevent racial and religious inequality. It made recommendations.

49. Germany commended Spain for the instrument of the Ombudsman. It asked how Spain had followed up on the recommendation of the Committee against Torture that Spain ensure sufficient resources to enable the Ombudsman to act as the national mechanism for the prevention of torture. It also asked in what way the country had continued its efforts to reduce the number of suicides and violent deaths in places of detention.

50. The Philippines noted that the domestic definition of trafficking should be in line with international standards and referred to the need for better identification of victims, including minors, and requested information in that regard. Philippines made recommendations.

51. France congratulated Spain on its recent ratification of Protocol No. 13 to the European Convention for the Promotion of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms, concerning the abolition of the death penalty in all circumstances, and asked that its Constitution be harmonized with the Protocol. It also asked whether Spain would put in place transparent tools for assessing complaints and condemnations concerning acts and incidents of a xenophobic or racist nature. France made recommendations.

52. The delegation of Spain elaborated on issues that had arisen during the interactive dialogue. Regarding the issue of the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, Spain had not rejected the idea of adhering to it, despite the fact that it believed that instrument to have legal shortcomings. The matter remained under study.

53. With regard to the Roma population, the delegation acknowledged the importance of enhancing the means for the social integration of that group. On 9 April, the Government had adopted an action plan for 2010-2012 to that end.

54. Concerning the issue of the use of Spanish airports for secret rendition operations by third countries, the delegation reiterated the Administration's position that respect for human rights should be at the centre of the fight against terrorism. Furthermore, the Minister for Foreign Affairs had provided the Chamber of Deputies and the European Parliament with extensive information about the subject.

55. On the definition of enforced disappearance, the delegation indicated that it had been included in the Penal Code in 2004.

56. With respect to the definitions of torture and incommunicado detention, the delegation indicated that the definition of torture was in conformity with international law. In that regard, it emphasized that there was no special anti-terrorism legal regime. Furthermore, incommunicado detentions were of short duration and were always monitored by the judiciary.

57. The Republic of Korea expressed concern about the reported cases of discrimination and violence against women, including domestic violence, and indicated that it was important that the Government extend its efforts beyond legislation to change perceptions about women and dispel associated stereotypes. It also noted the increasingly widespread problem of human trafficking and the incidence of intolerance and racial violence. The Republic of Korea made recommendations.

58. Qatar highlighted the fact that major developments in the area of human rights had occurred in recent decades. Since the promulgation of the 1978 Constitution, a legal and institutional framework had been established for the protection of human rights. It noted reports of increased incidents of racism against migrants and foreigners of different ethnic or religious origin. Qatar made a recommendation.

59. China welcomed the Government's adoption of the Human Rights Plan 2008-2012 and of other national human rights plans. It noted that the Human Rights Plan adopted in December 2008 was open-ended and asked whether that had had an effect on its actual implementation. It also asked what specific measures the Government had taken in recent years to protect the right to work and health of foreign migrants and minorities.

60. Australia commended Spain for its strong commitment to promoting and protecting human rights, its efforts in addressing gender violence and its considerable advances towards integrating migrants and combating xenophobia. It urged Spain to continue its efforts in those areas. Australia made recommendations.

61. In relation to the treatment of detained persons, Canada expressed concern about the allegations of torture and ill treatment, particularly in cases of incommunicado detention. It also noted the widespread concern that Spain's readmission agreements with several African countries did not include sufficient human rights guarantees. Canada made recommendations.

62. Sweden raised questions about measures taken to reinforce the implementation of existing legislation to combat domestic violence, and about measures whereby it would implement legislation granting refugee status on the basis of mistreatment based on gender

or sexual orientation, in order to address concerns that that legislation might have adverse effects in terms of limiting individuals' right to apply for asylum.

63. Israel stated that Spain, through its bid for membership in the Human Rights Council, would lend a positive and moral voice to the Council. It indicated that the national measures were welcome developments in the realization of human rights on the ground. Israel made recommendations.

64. Austria welcomed Spain's efforts to combat gender-based violence, but expressed concern about the high number of acts of violence against women. It asked about measures taken to counter the worsening perception of immigration and to ensure access to basic services for migrants. It also asked how Spain was seeking to address concerns about delayed access to a lawyer for persons in detention and about the length of pre-trial detention. Austria made recommendations.

65. Turkey indicated that it regarded the Human Rights Plan adopted by Spain in 2008 as the most tangible demonstration of the will to enhance human rights. It hoped that the measures introduced in relation to gender-based violence and the trafficking in women would yield successful results. Turkey requested information about Spain's efforts with regard to regulating migration and migrant's rights. It made a recommendation.

66. Slovenia stated that the Human Rights Committee had called for Spain to provide information concerning its national mechanism for the prevention of torture, the length of pre-trial detention and the expulsion of foreigners, and asked whether Spain intended to follow up on those issues. Slovenia also asked about plans to limit or eliminate incommunicado detention, as recommended by several international mechanisms. Slovenia made recommendations.

67. Paraguay welcomed Spain's cooperation with international monitoring bodies in the European and United Nations systems. It also stated that the Human Rights Plan 2008-2012 had provided for the establishment of a commission to follow up the Plan and the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action of 1993. It emphasized that any internal immigration policy needed to specifically consider the rights of migrants. Paraguay made a recommendation.

68. Hungary was concerned by the fact that the needs of women in rural areas were not being fully met and that they were exposed to a gender pay gap, as well as by the increasing violence, including domestic violence, committed against them. It expressed concern at the situation of Roma women and children. Hungary indicated that reports had revealed shortcomings in Spain's protection against torture. Hungary made recommendations.

69. Belgium saluted the efforts of Spain aimed at the abolition of the death penalty. It expressed concern over the situation in centres for the protection of minors with behavioural problems and in difficult social situations. It congratulated Spain on having adopted its first Human Rights Plan in December 2008, which included a national strategy for combating racism and xenophobia. Belgium made recommendations.

70. Bulgaria congratulated Spain on the active role it played at the international level in combating racism and xenophobia. It welcomed Spain's strategies for the development of the Roma population and asked about the main challenges in implementing those strategies. Bulgaria made a recommendation.

71. Portugal acknowledged Spain's commitment to human rights, as shown in its efforts related to the Alliance of Civilizations, its large financial contribution to OHCHR and its efforts to achieve the abolition of the death penalty. Portugal asked how international cooperation to combat human trafficking was being implemented; about measures adopted to ensure that cases of child mistreatment and abuse were properly reported; and about the assessment of the National Plan on Human Rights. Portugal made recommendations.

72. Azerbaijan noted the concern expressed by CEDAW about the persistence of entrenched, traditional stereotypes regarding the roles and responsibilities of women and men. It stated that several United Nations treaty bodies had expressed concern about information indicating a higher frequency of acts of intolerance and incidents of racial violence against migrants and persons of different ethnic or religious backgrounds, as well as the untimely and inadequate response of authorities. Azerbaijan made recommendations.

73. Italy raised questions about the achievements and challenges in the field of promoting human rights education and, given the unemployment rate, about how a balance could be achieved between reducing public expenditure and ensuring the protection of economic and social rights. It noted that, notwithstanding the efforts made to combat gender violence, the phenomenon had not been eradicated. Italy made a recommendation.

74. The Libyan Arab Jamahiriya stated that the establishment of an Ombudsman was insufficient in itself, and therefore that a national human rights institute should be established in accordance with the Paris Principles. It indicated that foreigners were not guaranteed the right to practice their religious beliefs. The Libyan Arab Jamahiriya requested information about the implementation of the recommendations of the national institution established to combat racism and xenophobia.

75. Burkina Faso praised the effort made by Spain during its presidency of the European Union to achieve a global moratorium on the execution of the death penalty by 2015, as well as the country's efforts to achieve recognition of the human right to water. It mentioned efforts aimed at asylum and refugee policy, integration policy, combating racism and xenophobia, and promoting the rights of foreigners. Burkina Faso made a recommendation.

76. Guatemala welcomed the establishment of the Forum for the Social Integration of Migrants and Spain's commitment to promoting a public policy aimed at combating racism and xenophobia. It encouraged Spain to share results achieved in combating discriminatory incidents against migrants, as well as best practices related to the fight against human trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation. Guatemala made a recommendation.

77. Japan stated that the high unemployment rate for migrant workers could lead to other problems. It noted the strategic plan for citizenship and the integration of migrant workers, and requested Spain to share its experiences and information concerning further measures to protect the rights of migrants. Japan indicated that a considerable number of reports referred to the disadvantaged position of women in society and violence against women, and made a recommendation in that regard.

78. Jordan commended Spain for its efforts in promoting understanding and tolerance among cultures through the Alliance of Civilizations. It noted Spain's achievements in adopting a legislative and institutional framework for the promotion of human rights; the ratification of most human rights instruments; and Spain's approach with regard to emerging rights, which had contributed to the development of international law. Jordan made a recommendation.

79. The delegation of Spain proceeded to respond to specific questions that had been raised. Concerning the issue of migrant affairs, it elaborated on the current legal and institutional framework. Specifically, it explained that the Law 2/2009 had broadened the scope of the rights recognized for migrant workers.

80. Moreover, the human rights plan of action had incorporated a comprehensive strategy for combating racism and xenophobia, including data collection and assistance networks for supporting victims.

81. The delegation stated that equal opportunity policies comprised the categories of gender-based violence, equal opportunity for men and women, and non-discrimination

based on other grounds. The Government was committed to submitting a bill to Congress in that regard. With regard to gender-based violence, the delegation explained that Spain had adopted an organic law providing for an institutional mechanism and an observatory to monitor implementation. It was worth noting that the number of victims had dropped by 8 per cent since the law had entered into force. The legislation also provided for special attention to migrant women, and the law on the rights of foreigners had been amended to include the possibility of ending expulsion procedures for women victims of gender-based violence and enabling them to apply for residence and work permits.

82. Regarding the rights of foreigners, the delegation further clarified that, as a result of the adoption of Law 4/2000 and the amendments thereto, the rights enjoyed by foreigners were nearly the same as those enjoyed by Spanish citizens, except for political rights. However, some bilateral agreements with third countries provided foreigners with the right to vote at the local level.

83. In concluding, the delegation recalled that it had extended a standing invitation to all special procedures of the Council and paid homage to the victims of terrorism.

II. Conclusions and/or recommendations

84. **The recommendations formulated during the interactive dialogue and listed below have been examined by Spain and enjoy its support:**

84.1. **Achieve the maximum implementation of the Human Rights Plan for 2008-2012 (Russian Federation);**

84.2. **Adopt further measures to provide members of the police, prison and judicial staff with human rights training with specifically focused on protection of human rights of women, children, ethnic or national minorities, and also of persons of minority sexual orientation or gender identity (Czech Republic);**

84.3. **Adopt specific measures to ensure the protection of the human rights of children of persons in detention or prison and to improve access to education for children with disabilities (Czech Republic);**

84.4. **Take immediate and all necessary steps to modernize its data and communication processes within its judicial branch (Netherlands);**

84.5. **Implement the human rights goals adopted in resolution 9/12 of the Human Rights Council (Brazil);**

84.6. **Put into effect the request for a visit by the Special Rapporteur on the Human Rights of Migrants (Uruguay);**

84.7. **Continue its efforts to combat discrimination and violence based on gender, race and ethnic origin, among others (Republic of Korea);**

84.8. **Continue its efforts to guarantee the rights of women and to eradicate gender discrimination, and pay special attention to combat gender-motivated violence against migrant women (Belarus);**

84.9. **Increase programmes aimed at combating prejudices regarding the role of women in society, in order to complement the legislative and institutional efforts to achieve de jure and de facto equality between men and women (Mexico);**

84.10. **Pursue its efforts to combat the persistence of traditional stereotypes regarding the role and responsibilities of women and men, namely by planning**

awareness-raising campaigns for the media and focused programmes in the education system (France);

84.11. Intensify media campaigns to strengthen efforts aimed at eliminating stereotyped images of men and women in the family and society (Portugal);

84.12. Address any remaining barriers to an equal sharing between women and men of paid and unpaid work (Norway);

84.13. Redouble efforts to diminish the wage gap between men and women and promote a higher representation of women in managerial and decision-making positions both in public administration and in the private sector (Peru);

84.14. Continue its activities to eliminate racism, xenophobia and other acts of intolerance (Turkey);

84.15. Step up its efforts to thoroughly investigate all acts of racial violence and punish those responsible appropriately, taking into account that the Committee against torture has expressed concerns about allegations that the authorities' responses to these acts are not always timely or adequate. Also, the Human Rights Committee and the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights expressed similar concerns (Egypt);

84.16. Do its utmost to combat racially motivated crimes and to ensure that human rights education is provided to any perpetrators of such offences (Qatar);

84.17. Take stern and swift action by the authorities on all complaints on the treatment of migrants by the public and private authorities, as well as regular publishing of data and reports about the incidents of racially motivated crimes (Pakistan);

84.18. Take more effective measures to combat racial discrimination and intolerance, including by collecting and publishing official statistics about incidents on racially motivated crimes and promptly investigating and taking stern action against the perpetrators of hatred, racist and xenophobic acts (Malaysia);

84.19. Collect statistics on racist and discriminatory incidents, and develop a national plan of action against racism and xenophobia, with an emphasis on social awareness (Uruguay);

84.20. Collect and publish statistics on hate crimes, and develop a specific national action plan against racism and xenophobia (United States of America);

84.21. Record and publish official statistics about incidents or reports on racially motivated crimes, and improve the collection of hate-crime data by law-enforcement officials and authorities (Egypt);

84.22. Strengthen measures to prevent, investigate and punish acts of violence against migrants when they occur, as well as allegations of the mistreatment of this group by some members of the police (Peru);

84.23. Take more effective measures to eliminate discrimination against non-citizens in relation to working conditions and work requirements, including employment rules and practices with discriminatory purposes or effects; and that legislation prohibiting discrimination in employment and all discriminatory practices in the labour market be fully implemented in practice and that further measures be taken to reduce unemployment among immigrants (Egypt);

- 84.24. Continue its efforts to improve the situation of the Roma population (Slovenia);
- 84.25. Continue its untiring efforts against the execution of the death penalty; and wishes Spain success with the Prime Minister's initiative which is aimed at achieving the immediate abolition of the death penalty for minors and persons with disabilities, and at achieving a global moratorium by 2015 (Bulgaria);
- 84.26. Take steps to improve its ability to prevent torture (Hungary);
- 84.27. Improve measures to ensure the timely detection and investigation of cases of police abuse (Azerbaijan);
- 84.28. Intensify training and information programmes for law enforcement officials to ensure full respect for human rights during the performance of their duties (Malaysia);
- 84.29. Reinforce its efforts to protect the rights of prisoners in police custody, including by duly investigating reports of ill treatment, prosecuting those responsible for confirmed abuses, and taking other appropriate preventive and corrective measures (Canada);
- 84.30. Continue to make efforts to combat gender-based violence (Colombia);
- 84.31. Continue its efforts to curb violence against women and to eliminate their stereotyping role in the society (Bangladesh);
- 84.32. Take more efficient steps to prevent and punish violence against women in all its manifestations (Hungary);
- 84.33. Further strengthen the implementation of some of the provisions of the law on comprehensive protection measures to tackle gender-based violence (Malaysia);
- 84.34. Build on its work to tackle gender-based violence, including through Basic Law 1/2004, and measures recently introduced to allow women who are illegal migrants to report acts of violence without fear of personal disadvantage (United Kingdom);
- 84.35. Accelerate efforts, under the Organization Act No. 1/2004 on comprehensive protection measures against gender-based violence, to facilitate access to medical and legal services for women in distress across Spain, particularly within immigrant communities (Canada);
- 84.36. Continue to adopt all legislative and executive measures against gender-based violence, with special attention to migrant victims (Italy);
- 84.37. Redouble its efforts to tackle the issue of violence against women, including domestic violence, by, for example, creating layers of legislative measures to safeguard victims as well as strengthening the overall implementation of relevant measures on this issue (Japan);
- 84.38. Consider the possibility to amend the criminal code to criminalize the trafficking in human beings for the purpose of sexual exploitation (Belarus);

- 84.39. Consider to adjust its legislation in order to specifically define the trafficking in human beings for the purpose of sexual exploitation (Costa Rica)²;
- 84.40. Amend existing legislation on human trafficking to include a definition of trafficking in line with international law (Indonesia);
- 84.41. Bring the definition of trafficking in its legislation into line with international law; establish better processes to identify victims; and address the special needs of child victims (New Zealand);
- 84.42. Consider modifying its criminal legislation so that the offence of human trafficking could specifically target trafficking for the purpose of sexual exploitation (France);
- 84.43. Include in its legislation a definition of sex trafficking in line with international law (Australia);
- 84.44. Consider utilizing the Recommended Principles and Guidelines on Human Rights and Human Trafficking developed by OHCHR as a reference tool (Philippines);
- 84.45. Continue to make efforts to implement and apply the Historical Memory Act (Colombia);
- 84.46. Continue its constructive efforts for the promotion of respect, tolerance, better understanding and cooperation among different cultures and religions through initiatives such as the Alliance of Civilizations and the Dialogue among Religions (Pakistan);
- 84.47. Redouble its efforts to continue to incorporate into its educational system, at all levels, respect for human rights, especially those related to non-discrimination and tolerance for diversity (Nicaragua);
- 84.48. Strengthen the human rights component in school curriculums and education programmes for the public, with special focus on women's rights (Republic of Korea);
- 84.49. Continue to address the issue of unaccompanied children arriving in Spanish territories and to consider implementing, as appropriate, the recommendations of UNHCR, human rights treaty bodies and special procedures (Jordan);
- 84.50. Strengthen national and local initiatives aimed at protecting and promoting the universal human rights of all migrants and members of their families (Philippines);
- 84.51. Continue and intensify the use of best practices in the area of human rights with regard to Spain's migration policies (Portugal);
- 84.52. Continue to support the Support Fund for the Admission, Integration and Education of Immigrants, as well as to support the work of various civil society organizations that work in favour of immigrants and that receive public funds to that end (Colombia);

² The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: "Consider adjusting its legislation in order to typify specifically trafficking in human beings with purposes of sexual exploitation and consider access to asylum procedures to victims of trafficking" (Costa Rica).

- 84.53. Reinforce measures aimed at ensuring, during this period of crisis, effective protection of the human rights of migrants, and take additional measures to guarantee access to economic, social and cultural rights for migrants, who are the primary victims of the high level of unemployment in Spain (Algeria);
- 84.54. Take all measures necessary to ensure that actions related to unaccompanied minors (migrants, asylum seekers, refugees, victims of trafficking) are in line with international standards (Uruguay);
- 84.55. Enhance its cooperation programmes with developing countries (Philippines);
- 84.56. Continue its cooperation with civil society organizations in the follow-up to this review (Austria).
85. The following recommendations enjoy the support of Spain, which considers that they are already implemented or in the process of implementation:
- 85.1. Ratify the Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (Portugal, Azerbaijan);
- 85.2. Provide intensive training to law enforcement officials to ensure that, in the performance of their duties, they respect and protect human dignity and maintain and uphold the human rights of all persons without distinction as to race, colour or national or ethnic origin (Egypt);
- 85.3. Take all appropriate steps to ensure the implementation of the Council on Women's Participation, created by Organic Law 3/2007, in view of the important role played by non-governmental organizations and other civil society organizations in the promotion of women's human rights and gender equality, as recommended by CEDAW (Israel);
- 85.4. Ensure implementation of the gender equality measures to the rural areas including for the migrant female workers (Pakistan);
- 85.5. Formulate and implement a national action plan against racism and xenophobia, with ample participation on the part of civil society and input from the Spanish observatory on racism and xenophobia (Bolivia);
- 85.6. Extend and consolidate into a national action plan its measures to combat racism and xenophobia (United Kingdom);
- 85.7. Develop a national action plan against racism and xenophobia (Azerbaijan);
- 85.8. Widely distribute information on available domestic remedies against acts of racial discrimination and the legal means available for obtaining compensation in the event of discrimination (Egypt);
- 85.9. Implement its intentions to adopt a national plan of action on the interests of the Roma population (Russian Federation);
- 85.10. Eliminate all forms of discrimination against the Roma community, migrants and religious minorities, and take necessary measures against the perpetrators of racially motivated acts against migrants and ethnic and religious minorities (Bangladesh);
- 85.11. Put in place appropriate mechanisms to improve the situation of the Roma minority with respect to access to education, employment and health care (Hungary);

- 85.12. **Take effective measures to investigate all allegations of serious human rights violations and abuses committed by law enforcement officials and private security guards (Malaysia);**
- 85.13. **Ensure that persons deprived of their liberty have access to their fundamental freedoms at all times (Costa Rica)³;**
- 85.14. **Adopt educational measures, from childhood, to foster social rejection of violence against women and children and encourage the use of complaints against such cases (Portugal);**
- 85.15. **Ensure that all victims of gender-based violence have effective access to appropriate resources, including legal assistance and protection measures (Austria);**
- 85.16. **Consider treatment of perpetrators of violence against women and other models targeting the aggressor as a complement to other measures (Norway);**
- 85.17. **Include immigrant women in irregular situations in all policies aimed at the prevention of and protection against gender violence (Bolivia);**
- 85.18. **Provide effective access to legal assistance and measures of protection for all victims of gender violence, including migrants with irregular migration status (Uruguay);**
- 85.19. **Bring promptly all detainees before a judge (Netherlands);**
- 85.20. **Ensure the effective enjoyment of the right to education, the right to work and the right to health for members of ethnic minorities and migrants (Cuba);**
- 85.21. **Promote and carry out comprehensive education and training in human rights in the Spanish education system and in programmes for public employees, armed forces and military personnel at every level (Costa Rica);**
- 85.22. **Enact human rights education programmes targeted at fighting racism, xenophobia, and discrimination and violence against women (Philippines);**
- 85.23. **Address, in a comprehensive manner, the rise of negative attitudes towards immigrants as reported in the 2009 Spanish Racism and Xenophobia Report (Austria);**
- 85.24. **Ensure full respect for the rights of migrants, including through the strengthening of measures against acts of racial discrimination, xenophobia and intolerance (Cuba);**
- 85.25. **Strengthen policies that guarantee the human rights of migrant workers (Brazil)⁴;**
- 85.26. **Pay particular attention to the vulnerable situation of migrants, especially women in an irregular situation (Slovenia);**

³ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: “Review incommunicado detention regime and ensure that persons deprived of their liberty have at any moment access to their fundamental freedoms” (Costa Rica).

⁴ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: “Strengthen policies that guarantee the human rights of migrant workers and the prevalence of human rights in combating terrorism” (Brazil).

- 85.27. Take all appropriate measures that serve the interests of the welfare and development of child migrants, who should have been guaranteed all rights provided for in national legislation and international law (Belarus);
- 85.28. Strengthen policies that guarantee the prevalence of human rights in combating terrorism (Brazil)⁵;
- 85.29. Pursue and intensify its cooperation with countries interested in combating the phenomenon of terrorism by strictly respecting its bilateral and multilateral commitments (Algeria);
86. The following recommendations will be examined by Spain, which will provide responses in due course, but no later than the fifteenth session of the Human Rights Council, in September 2010. The response of Spain to these recommendations will be included in the outcome report adopted by the Human Rights Council at its fifteenth session.
- 86.1. Sign and ratify the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Indonesia, Burkina Faso);
- 86.2. Ratify the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Azerbaijan);
- 86.3. Ratify and implement the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Bolivia);
- 86.4. Ratify the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families as a fundamental step towards the protection of human rights (Guatemala);
- 86.5. Ratify the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, and, by taking that measure, clearly demonstrate its firm and decisive commitment to protecting migrant groups and to finding solutions to problems that may arise, by fully respecting the fundamental freedoms of those affected (Paraguay);
- 86.6. Adhere to the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Nicaragua);
- 86.7. Pursue its efforts, and continue, to guarantee all human rights; and accede to the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Palestine);
- 86.8. Become a party to the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Pakistan);
- 86.9. Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Argentina)⁶;

⁵ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: “Strengthen policies that guarantee the human rights of migrant workers and the prevalence of human rights in combating terrorism” (Brazil).

⁶ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: “Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families and adopt measures aimed at ensuring equal treatment of migrants, regardless of their migratory situation” (Argentina).

- 86.10. Consider the ratification of the Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families (Peru);
- 86.11. Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrants Workers and Members of Their Families (Nigeria)⁷;
- 86.12. Reconsider, in the same spirit of openness, the possibility of ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families, in accordance with paragraph 12.1 of recommendation no. 1737 of 17 March 2006 of the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe, of which Spain is an active member (Algeria);
- 86.13. Recognize the competence of the Committee established under the Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearance (Argentina);
- 86.14. Consider introducing a specific prohibition with respect to the sale of arms when the final destination is a country where children may potentially be recruited or used in hostilities (Slovenia);
- 86.15. Consider introducing an earmarked quota for fathers in the parental leave (Norway);
- 86.16. Fully cooperate with relevant United Nations treaty bodies by implementing their recommendations pertaining to ending racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance (Egypt);
- 86.17. Pursue its efforts related to the fight against racism and xenophobia by establishing, with a calendar for concrete action, a national and complete strategy for combating racism and xenophobia, as announced in its first national Human Rights Plan (Belgium);
- 86.18. Undertake a comprehensive set of measures, in practice and law, including developing a national plan of action against racism, to combat racial discrimination against foreigners and religious minorities, in particular Muslims (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 86.19. Clarify the definition of torture in its penal code, and enforce an absolute prohibition of torture under any circumstances (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 86.20. Review the definition of torture in its national law so that it complies fully with that in article 1 of the Convention against the Torture and other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment (Czech Republic);
- 86.21. Take additional measures to prevent criminal offences, including assault, by police officers and prison guards from occurring, and ensure that the personal integrity of detainees is guaranteed (Netherlands);
- 86.22. Ensure that access to legal assistance upon detention is not delayed, that detainees have the possibility to communicate with a lawyer in private and that they are brought in front of a judge within 72 hours, as stipulated by law (Austria);

⁷ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: “Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrants Workers and Members of Their Families, and abolish all laws and regulations discriminating against immigrants” (Nigeria).

- 86.23. Respond to all recommendations set out in the report of the Ombudsman relating to the protection of the interests of minors having behavioural problems and in difficult social situations; pay more specific attention to the rights of such minors to have appropriate educational and medical support; and effectively implement an internal common regulation and an efficient inspection system in centres to prevent and combat abuse (Belgium);
- 86.24. Strengthen work with the European Union and international partners to combat human trafficking, with a policy of prevention as a priority for its 2009-2012 work plan (Canada);
- 86.25. Strengthen the policy of promoting children rights, with special attention to the trafficking in women and children, and consider the implementation of the Guidelines for the Appropriate Use and Conditions of Alternative Care for Children, in accordance with Human Rights Council resolution 11/7 and General Assembly resolution 64/142 (Brazil);
- 86.26. Investigate, punish and redress crimes of enforced disappearance, regardless of the time of their occurrence, in the light of the continuous nature of the crime and in accordance with its international obligations (Mexico);
- 86.27. Ensure school integration of Roma children, children belonging to immigrant families or children living in socio-economically deprived areas, as expressed by CEDAW, and increase Roma women's awareness and access to services and programmes in education, employment and healthcare, as recommended by CERD, CESCR, and the CRC (Israel);
- 86.28. Respect fully the principle of non-refoulement and ensure effective access to asylum procedures, taking into account the objectives of UNHCR's 10-Point Plan on Mixed Migration (New Zealand);
- 86.29. Undertake a review of its readmission agreements with respect to refugees and asylum-seekers, and amend them as necessary to ensure that they contain human rights guarantees in line with international standards (Canada);
- 86.30. Consider access to asylum procedures for victims of trafficking (Costa Rica)⁸;
- 86.31. Adopt measures aimed at ensuring the equal treatment of migrants, regardless of their migratory situation (Argentina)⁹;
- 86.32. Abolish all laws and regulations discriminating against immigrants (Nigeria)¹⁰;

⁸ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: "Consider adjusting its legislation in order to typify specifically trafficking in human beings with purposes of sexual exploitation and consider access to asylum procedures to victims of trafficking" (Costa Rica).

⁹ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: "Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrant Workers and Members of Their Families and adopt measures aimed at ensuring equal treatment of migrants, regardless of their migratory situation" (Argentina).

¹⁰ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: "Consider ratifying the International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of All Migrants Workers and Members of Their Families, and abolish all laws and regulations discriminating against immigrants" (Nigeria).

- 86.33. Ensure that all migrants have effective access to services related to economic, social and cultural rights, irrespective of their migration status (Uruguay);
- 86.34. Implement the National Ombudsman's call for authorities to ascertain the age of younger immigrants, so that the most appropriate protection can be arranged (United States of America).
87. The recommendations below did not enjoy the support of Spain:
- 87.1. Follow the principle of applying limits on freedoms to those organisations and entities that are involved in spread of hate speech, make xenophobic or defamatory statements and incite discrimination and violence (Pakistan);
- 87.2. Undertake immediate steps to establish an independent police complaints mechanism with a mandate to investigate all allegations of serious human rights violations by law enforcement officials in cases such as sexual violence in custody (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 87.3. Consider taking steps to establish an independent police complaints mechanism with the aim to investigate all allegations of serious human rights violations by law enforcement officials (Denmark);
- 87.4. Review the compliance of its anti-terrorism legislation allowing for incommunicado detention with international human rights standards (Czech Republic);
- 87.5. Review the incommunicado detention regime (Costa Rica)¹¹;
- 87.6. Review the use of incommunicado detention for offences involving terrorists or armed gangs, which may last for up to 13 days (Austria);
- 87.7. Address the distinction made between Spanish and foreign nationals to the detriment of the latter group when remanding custody during investigations (Austria);
- 87.8. Continue developing awareness-raising measures in educational policies in fighting gender-based violence in order to tackle the deeply rooted stereotypes vis-à-vis women (Austria);
- 87.9. Adopt a national plan of action to combat violence against women and girls and to ensure that all victims of gender-based violence have effective access to legal assistance and protection measures (Islamic Republic of Iran);
- 87.10. Consider instigating a national plan to combat violence against women and girls, including in relation to human trafficking (Denmark);
- 87.11. Develop a national plan of action on eliminating violence against women (Australia);
- 87.12. Establish a mechanism guaranteeing the correct identification of victims of the trafficking in persons and provide them with adequate and comprehensive support, especially in the case of minors (Bolivia);

¹¹ The recommendation as read during the interactive dialogue: "Review incommunicado detention regime and ensure that persons deprived of their liberty have at any moment access to their fundamental freedoms" (Costa Rica).

- 87.13. Consider the establishment of a national mechanism for the correct identification of victims of sexual exploitation, as well as the possibility of including specific measures for minors (Panama);
- 87.14. Establish a national mechanism to identify all victims and take necessary measures to ensure access to the asylum procedure for foreign women who are victims of trafficking, or at the risk of being trafficked, who can show a need for international protection, as recommended by CEDAW, CRC, and the CESCR, in light of the serious efforts made by the Government of Spain to adopt a Plan to Combat Human Trafficking for the Purposes of Sexual Exploitation (Israel);
- 87.15. Reinforce due-process safeguards for detainees imprisoned for conduct allegedly related to terrorism or to the operation of armed groups (Argentina);
- 87.16. Continue to pursue open migration policy and regularize existing migrants with irregular status (Bangladesh);
- 87.17. Address and provide adequate follow-up to the recommendations of the Special Rapporteur for the protection of human rights and fundamental freedoms while countering terrorism, as a result of his visit to the country, in coordination with relevant ministries and by consulting civil society organizations (Mexico);
- 87.18. Thoroughly and independently investigate all circumstances surrounding its involvement in rendition programmes (Islamic Republic of Iran);
88. All conclusions and/or recommendations set out in the present report reflect the positions of the submitting State(s) and/or the State under review. They should not be construed as endorsed by the Working Group as a whole.

Annex

Composition of the delegation

The delegation of Spain was headed by H.E. Jose de Francisco, Secretary of State for Constitutional and Parliamentary Affairs, Ministry of the Presidency, and was composed of the following members:

- H.E. Javier Garrigues, Permanent Representative of Spain to the United Nations Office and Other International Organizations in Geneva;
- Ms. M^a Angeles Ahumada, Director General for Legal Coordination, Ministry of the Presidency;
- Mr. Arcadi España, Chief of Cabinet of the Secretary of State for Constitutional and Parliamentary Affairs, Ministry of the Presidency;
- Mr. Jorge Domecq, Director General of United Nations, Global Affairs and Human Rights, Ministry for Foreign Affairs and Cooperation;
- Mr. Juan Manuel de Barandica, Ambassador at Large for Strategic Affairs, Ministry for Foreign Affairs and Cooperation;
- Mr. Luis Fernandez Cid, Deputy Director General of Legal and Consular Affairs, Ministry for Foreign Affairs and Cooperation;
- Mr. Antonio Pastor Palomar, Technical Counsellor, International Legal Counsel, Ministry for Foreign Affairs and Cooperation;
- Mr. Eduardo Escribano, Deputy Director General, Human Rights Office, Ministry for Foreign Affairs and Cooperation;
- Mr. Manuel Garcia Risco, Adviser to the Cabinet of the Secretary of State for Security, Ministry of Interior;
- Mr. Angel Ariño, Adviser to the Cabinet of the Secretary of State for Security, Ministry of Interior;
- Ms. Francisca Vidal Torregrosa, Adviser, Sub-Directorate for Asylum, Ministry of Interior;
- Mr. Joaquin de Fuentes, General Counsel of the State, Ministry of Justice;
- Ms. Maria Luisa Garcia, Counsel of the State before the Constitutional Court and the European Court for Human Rights, Ministry of Justice;
- Mr. Isaac Salama, Counsel of the State before the Constitutional Court and the European Court for Human Rights, Ministry of Justice;
- Mr. Iñigo Ortiz de Urbina, Adviser to the Minister, Ministry of Justice;
- Mr. Nicolas Marugan, Director of the Spanish Observatory on Racism and Xenophobia, Ministry of Labour and Immigration;
- Ms. Silvia Parra Nuñez, Adviser to the Cabinet of the Minister, Ministry of Labour and Immigration;
- Ms. Tatiana Dorrego, Adviser, General Directorate for the Integration of Immigrants;

- Mr. Felipe Vizcarro Germade, Deputy Director General of Housing Subsidies, Ministry of Housing;
 - Mr. Diego Blazquez, Adviser to the Cabinet of the Minister, Ministry of Equality;
 - Ms. Luz Cid Ruiz, Adjunct to the Secretary General of IMSERSO, Ministry of Health and Social Policy;
 - Ms. Inmaculada Lasala Meseguer, Deputy Director General, Ministry of Health and Social Policy;
 - Mr. Manuel Montero Rey, Chief of the International Service – IMSERSO, Ministry of Health and Social Policy;
 - Mr. Angel Santamaria, Adviser to the Cabinet of the Minister, Ministry for Education;
 - Mr. Pablo Gomez de Olea, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Spain to the United Nations Office and Other International Organizations in Geneva;
 - Mr. Juan Villar, Counsellor, Permanent Mission of Spain to the United Nations Office and Other International Organizations in Geneva.
-