

# WRITTEN COMMENTS

of the European Roma Rights Centre Concerning France

For Consideration by the Human Rights Council, within its Universal Periodic Review, for Consideration at its 29th Session (January–February 2018)



CHALLENGING DISCRIMINATION PROMOTING EQUALITY

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>Introduction</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Housing and Evictions</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Access to Water</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Low Access to Education for Romani Children in France</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Racially Motivated Attacks Against Roma in France</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Hate Speech Against Roma in France</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Recommendations</b>	<b>7</b>

## INTRODUCTION

The European Roma Rights Centre (ERRC)<sup>1</sup> hereby submits this report to the United Nations Human Rights Council (HRC) for the universal periodic review of France's compliance with its human rights commitments. This report focuses on housing, forced evictions, access to water and sanitation.

## HOUSING AND EVICTIONS

- 1 As a State Party to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination, France is legally obliged to respect, protect and fulfil the right to adequate housing, including the prohibition of forced evictions.<sup>2</sup>
- 2 In France, the right to housing is directly recognised in domestic law on housing, which provides “[...] the right to housing is a duty for the entire nation. Any person or family experiencing particular difficulties, partly because of the inadequacy of its resources or its conditions of existence, is entitled to assistance from the community, under conditions established by this Act, for access to decent and independent housing where they can remain”.<sup>3</sup>
- 3 Despite domestic and international legal standards, between 15,000 and 20,000<sup>4</sup> Roma in France live in substandard housing and experience multiple forced evictions, which leave them in increasingly marginalised, poor and unstable conditions. During the review period, the ERRC has monitored the forced evictions of Romani EU citizens (i.e. citizens of other EU Member States) in France. Romani communities are frequently evicted, and some are evicted repeatedly within short periods of time. Roma have in particular been targeted for forced eviction following statements by then-President Nicolas Sarkozy in July 2010 calling for the dismantling of illegal “nomad” (Romani) camps throughout the country.<sup>5</sup> Seven years later, evictions of Roma continue at a high pace:
  - a In 2013, French authorities forcibly evicted more than 21,537 Romani migrants, more than double the total for 2012. Law enforcement officers carried out 165 evictions affecting almost 19,380 people. There were 22 evictions due to fire, affecting 2,157 Roma.<sup>6</sup>
  - b In 2014, 13,483 people were evicted by law enforcement officers from 138 different locations. A further 966 people were left homeless due to fire or floods. Compared to the 2013 figures, the numbers in 2014 were lower, but still represent almost 80% of the total population living in slums and squats. In some regions in France people living in slums and squats were evicted at an astonishing rate, whilst others has a significantly lower pace of eviction by authorities. This suggests harassment perpetrated by the authorities within these critical regions and unequal treatment across the country.<sup>7</sup> Our 2014 figures

1 The ERRC is a Roma-led international public interest law organisation working to combat anti-Romani racism and human rights abuse of Roma through strategic litigation, research and policy development, advocacy and human rights education. Since its establishment in 1996, the ERRC has endeavored to provide Roma with the tools necessary to combat discrimination and achieve equal access to justice, education, housing, health care and public services. The ERRC has consultative status with the Council of Europe, as well as with the Economic and Social Council of the United Nations. The ERRC has been regularly reporting to the United Nations Committees on the situation of Roma in various countries of Europe and submitted several Parallel reports to the Human Rights Committee. More information is available at: [www.errc.org](http://www.errc.org)

2 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights Article 17(1)(2), and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Article 11(1), supported by General Comments 4 (right to adequate housing) and 7 (protection against forced evictions) of the Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination. Article 5.

3 France, Law no 90-449 for the implementation of housing rights, Article 1.

4 See: <http://www.gouvernement.fr/campements-illicites-et-bidonvilles>.

5 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-un-upr-submission-9-july-2012.pdf>.

6 Census: Forced evictions of migrant Roma in France, ERRC (2014), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-detailed-report-14-january-2014.pdf>.

7 Census: Forced evictions of migrant Roma in France (2014), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/report%20forced%20evictions%20-%20final%20en.pdf>.

showed clearly that the way the authorities deal with the slums is different according to the regions of France they are in. According to the results of the survey of forced evictions for 2014 there appeared to be a policy of harassment in the Paris and Lyon regions. In the regions of Lille, Bordeaux and Marseille, 35 - 69% of the people living in slums were evicted, a rate which made ostensible attempts at integration extremely unlikely to succeed. In the regions where there were fewer evictions per person living in slums, there appeared to be a real chance for integration of Romani people.<sup>8</sup>

- c In 2015 11,128 Roma were forcibly evicted by the authorities from 111 living sites. 410 persons had to leave five sites due to fire. These figures demonstrate that 60% of those living in slums were forcefully evicted by the authorities during 2015, half of them in the summer period. The Île-de-France (Greater Paris) region accounted for more than 60% of the forced evictions in France.<sup>9</sup> On average, 80% of the evictions concerned slums located on land owned by public bodies. Given that the land on which slums are located consists of about 50% publicly-owned land and 50% privately-owned land, our 2015 data showed that forced evictions were much more likely to happen when the slums are situated on land owned by a public body. This suggests that the purpose of the state policy of systemic forced evictions is not to defend private property (a pretext which is often used to justify forced evictions). This also strengthens the ERRC's view that forced evictions of Roma in France should be seen as systemic discrimination practised by the State against Roma.
  - d In 2016, a total of 10,119 Romani people were forcefully evicted by the authorities from 76 sites, a 9% decrease compared to 2015 (11,128 evicted people from 116 living areas). In addition, 345 Romani people left seven sites due to fires caused mainly by bad living conditions.<sup>10</sup> In 2016 an increase of forced evictions without any legal decision was observed. More than half of these forced evictions (41 of 76) took place without any court decision, on the basis of safety risk or health hazard notices issued by mayors or prefects which are not subject to automatic judicial review or judicial review with suspensive effect. The highest rate of such evictions was observed in Île-de-France.
- 4 Most of these forced evictions are marked by the same human rights violations, notably the failure to provide evictees with adequate (or indeed any) alternative accommodation, as France is obliged to do under international law. Indeed, France was reminded of this forcefully in October 2013 when the European Court of Human Rights found a violation of the European Convention on Human Rights in the case of *Winterstein v France*; the Court made a point of emphasising that “*numerous international instruments, some of which have been adopted within the Council of Europe, emphasise the necessity, in the event of the forced eviction of Roma and travellers, of providing them with alternative housing*”.<sup>11</sup> No durable solution, or measures for integration were provided even for those most vulnerable, among which are pregnant women, persons with disabilities, and the elderly. The ERRC is currently representing applicants in three separate cases pending before the European Court of Human Rights concerning forced evictions, and is aware of at least one other pending case there.
  - 5 Often the multiple evictions aggravate the situation for school-age children in particular. The removal from their homes leads to an interruption of the schooling process and negatively affects their psychological well-being. 2013 ERRC research in three regions and on six sites focusing on the human rights of Romanian Roma living on informal sites in France found that due to frequent forced evictions, 50% of respondents said that they, their children, or both, suffered from psychological problems due to forced evictions. Of respondents reporting that their children had health problems after an eviction, 69% claimed those problems were psychological.<sup>12</sup> The ERRC is representing children whose education has been interrupted in a communication pending before the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child (see below, access to education).

8 *Ibid*, p.1.

9 Census of forced evictions in living areas occupied by Roma (or persons designed as such) in France (2015), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-census-of-forced-evictions-in-living-areas-occupied-by-roma-2015.pdf>.

10 Census of forced evictions in living areas occupied by Roma (or persons designated as such) in France(2016), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/roma-eviction-census-france-2016.pdf>.

11 Judgment of 17 October 2013, para.159.

12 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-cerd-submission-23-march-2015.pdf>.

## ACCESS TO WATER

- 6 ERRC published research<sup>13</sup> in 2017 concerning Romani people's access to water in 93 communities in seven countries, including 18 Romani neighbourhoods in France. The research showed that Romani people living in slums have inadequate drinking water and sanitation. Of the seven countries, the highest number of documented cases amounting to discrimination were observed in France. These Roma communities have either significantly more complicated access, or they are charged higher fees which disproportionately affect their family incomes, or they have to cross long distances (a few kilometres in some cases) to get water from fire hydrants or public fountains:
- a In some informal camps in Lille, located between highways or on roundabouts, people had no direct access to drinking water. Others are built around detached fire hydrants in the industrial zones of the city. These hydrants are mechanically opened and water usually runs uninterrupted for the entire day. One hydrant serves as the water supply for around 100-150 Romani people. Despite frequent oral warnings, neither the police nor firemen nor other municipal officials have undertaken any action to cut off this water supply. There is only one camp with chemical toilets installed (La Cruppe); people from other camps included in the research defecate in the open.<sup>14</sup>
  - b In Besançon, France, a halting site for Travellers (Gens du voyage),<sup>15</sup> water charges are negotiated and made higher by the operators of the site (which is illegal according to the French law). The so-called Beson Law<sup>16</sup> stipulates that each municipality with over 5,000 residents has to provide a halting site for the caravans of Gens du voyage. These sites can either be managed directly by the municipality or by private companies. The halting sites are equipped with public taps and public showers and the site managers charge daily parking fees and service fees for using these utilities. In most sites, there are common water meters and blanket fees are applied according to the number of people living in the caravan. In some halting sites the people arriving in caravans have to pre-pay for these services, usually on a weekly basis (such as on the halting site of La Malcombe in Besançon, for example). Sometimes a parking lot has an individual water meter with pre-paid credit system locks. According to interviews the ERRC conducted with Travellers on La Malcombe halting site in Besançon, water access is cut off if people do not pay the fee. Despite the fact that since 2015, French law forbids disconnecting people from water due to payment arrears,<sup>17</sup> our research indicates that managers of halting sites for Travellers across France continue cutting off the water.<sup>18</sup>

## LOW ACCESS TO EDUCATION FOR ROMANI CHILDREN IN FRANCE

- 7 On 17 May 2017 a new study<sup>19</sup> was released by Trajectoires regarding slums in France and access to basic rights for those who live in such places. This study includes a survey which shows that 98% of people living

13 The research collected evidence on access to safe and affordable drinking water and sanitation in Romani communities. The research has focused on analysing problems with the accessibility, affordability, and quality of drinking water resources, as well as with sanitation in Romani neighbourhoods. The research has also examined potential cases of racial discrimination in the distribution and availability of these public utilities. Thursting for justice, ERRC, 2017, available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/thirsting-for-justice-march-2017.pdf>.

14 See: Szilvasi, M. Zaharieva, R. (2016) 'Denied the Right to Water: the Miserable Fate of Roma in France', in: ERRC blog, available at: <http://www.errc.org/blog/denied-the-right-to-water-the-miserable-fate-ofroma-in-france/101>; 'Thursting for Justice.Europe's Roma Denied Access to Clean Water and Sanitation', ERRC (2017), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/thirsting-for-justice-march-2017.pdf>.

15 The definition of "Roma and Travellers" according to the Council of Europe qualifies Roma, Sinti/Manush, Calé, Kaale, Romanichals, Boyash/Rudari; Balkan Egyptians (Egyptians and Ashkali); Eastern groups (Dom, Lom and Abdal); and, on the other hand, groups such as Travellers, Yenish, and the populations designated under the administrative term "Gens du voyage", persons who identify themselves as Gypsies or Roma: <http://www.coe.int/en/web/portal/roma>.

16 Law No. 2000-614 of July 5, 2000 on accommodation of gens du voyage, available at: <https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT00000583573>.

17 French Constitutional Court, Decision No. 2015-470-QPC [Conseil Constitutionnel, décision n° 2015-470 QPC], 29 May 2015, available at: <http://www.conseil-constitutionnel.fr/conseil-constitutionnel/francais/lesdecisions/acces-par-date/decisions-depuis-1959/2015/2015-470-qpc/decision-n-2015-470-qpc-du-29-mai-2015.143832.html>.

18 Thursting for Justice.Europe's Roma Denied Access to Clean Water and Sanitation", ERRC (2017), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/thirsting-for-justice-march-2017.pdf>.

19 See: <http://www.romeurope.org/etude-de-trajectoires-habitants-bidonvilles-france-connaissance-parcours-acces-droit-commun/>.

in slums come from Romania and 90% of them identify themselves as Roma.<sup>20</sup> According to this research 30% of the children living in slums and squats have never been enrolled in school. The phenomenon of early school drop-outs or lack of school enrolment appears to be ignored by the responsible authorities.

- 8 The study made clear that Romani migration from Romania to France is due mainly to economic reasons, contrary to existing stereotypes about “Roma migration due to cultural particularities” as well as stereotypes about “Roma criminality” by referring to statistics in the field.
- 9 Only 47% of Romani respondents to the ERRC’s survey<sup>21</sup> said that their school-age children in France were in school; that is less than half of the enrolment rate of French children. Among respondents with school-age children out of school, 59.4% reported that this was because they had been told by administrators that there is no place in their school.<sup>22</sup>
- 10 Refusal to enroll Romani children in schools is discriminatory and in direct violation of international human rights standards, particularly Article 5(e)(v) of the UN CERD. The majority (60%) of respondents with children in school said that their children have no problems, but 27% said that their children had problems concerning money (to pay for food, clothes, supplies etc.), 10% reported that other pupils do not treat them well, and 10% said that the school administration treats them poorly.<sup>23</sup>
- 11 In 2016 the ERRC has sent an Individual Communication to the Committee on the Rights of the Child Concerning France regarding a case of multiple evictions of a Romani family, with 3 children living in Champs-sur-Marne. The case exemplifies the impact of evictions on school enrolment and school attendance of Romani children.

## RACIALLY MOTIVATED ATTACKS AGAINST ROMA IN FRANCE

- 12 The ERRC has been compiling a list of racially motivated attacks against Roma based on field monitoring and media articles. The response of the French authorities, which in the ERRC’s view has been inadequate, engages Article 5(b) UN CERD. In a number of instances, racially motivated attacks against Romani individuals and communities remain unpunished.
- 13 A list of racially motivated attacks against Roma is available in appendix 1.

## HATE SPEECH AGAINST ROMA IN FRANCE

- 14 A study<sup>24</sup> from the Commission Nationale Consultative des Droits de l’Homme (CNCDDH) from June 2014 says that Roma are among the least tolerated communities in France.<sup>25</sup> The opinion polls in that study also show the “rise of blatant and downplayed forms of prejudices against Roma”. The US-based “Pew Research Center” has shown that in Europe the exclusion of Roma is much higher than that of Muslims and Jews. In France, two out of three survey respondents have unfavourable opinions of Roma according to the survey.<sup>26</sup>
- 15 This climate of hate against Roma engages France’s responsibility under multiple provisions of, inter alia, the UN CERD, particularly Article 7. The ERRC has been compiling a list of anti-Roma statements thanks to in-the field monitoring and media articles. This list is available in Appendix 1.

20 La Croix, Comment on vit dans les bidonvilles en France, 17 May 2017: <http://www.la-croix.com/France/Exclusion/Comment-vit-bidonvilles-France-2017-05-17-1200847748>.

21 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/report%20forced%20evictions%20-%20final%20en.pdf>.

22 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-cerd-submission-23-march-2015.pdf>.

23 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-cerd-submission-23-march-2015.pdf>.

24 See: <http://www.pewglobal.org/2014/05/12/chapter-4-views-of-roma-muslims-jews/>.

25 See: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-cerd-submission-23-march-2015.pdf>.

26 See: <http://www.pewglobal.org/2014/05/12/chapter-4-views-of-roma-muslims-jews/>.

- 16 In its annual report published on 30 March 2017, the CNCDH highlighted the presence of “intensified racism” leading to violations of fundamental rights. Antigypsyism is expressed both by “rejection of cultural differences” as well as the perception of Roma as a “threat to the national [security] order [...]” powered by political discourse tending to justify the failure of integration initiatives “by the mere attitude of the beneficiaries”. Another example of the rejection of the Roma community is the “ambiguous policy towards slum dismantling, in which the repressive approach being favoured [...]” leading to “organised wandering”.<sup>27</sup>

## RECOMMENDATIONS

### **General recommendations to the French authorities for improving respect for the human rights of Roma from other EU Member States residing in France:**

- 1 Introduce appropriate, targeted measures into the French National Roma Integration Strategy to address the inclusion of Roma from other EU Member States effectively and holistically, allocate sufficient funds for their implementation, and effectively monitor their results.
- 2 Give full effect to the rights of Roma to free movement without discrimination (i.e. Article 2 (1), 26 in conjunction with 12 (1) UN ICCPR) by taking advantage of the facilities offered by the European Commission to facilitate the social integration of Roma.
- 3 Immediately cease the costly and ineffective practice of evicting and expelling Roma from their homes and communities without undertaking any proportionality analysis and without any sustainable solution for housing. Until such time as all Roma from other Member States are able to access regular housing, ensure the provision of water, sanitation, and other services to informal Romani communities.
- 4 Monitor the implementation of the 26 August 2012 Circular requiring public authorities to conduct social assessments to identify alternative housing in advance of evictions.
- 5 Investigate all reports of violence or degrading treatment by police or public officials during evictions of Romani communities. Pursue appropriate sanctions against any police officer or public official found to be guilty.
- 6 Ensure equal access to basic rights, including water and sanitation, health insurance and health care, access to emergency housing, education and legal aid, for Roma from other Member States.
- 7 Increase support for NGOs working to facilitate the inclusion and integration of Romani communities in France.
- 8 Establish partnerships with civil society organisations providing support to Romani migrants, to advance both the punishment of racist acts of violence and the follow-up action to the lodging of complaints in this connection.
- 9 Combat all manifestations of racism against Roma and ensure that all instances of anti-Roma violence and hate speech acts do not go unpunished.
- 10 Harmonise legislation to ensure racially-motivated instances of hate-speech are criminalised.

### **Recommendations to ensure respect for the rights of EU-citizen Romani children in France to access education without discrimination:**

- 11 Investigate all reported cases of refusal by mayors to enrol Romani children. Require the immediate enrolment of all school-age Romani children. Pursue sanctions against offending mayors, particularly under anti-discrimination laws. Provide special support to help Romani children who have previously faced refusal for enrolment so they can make up the time they have missed in school.

### **Appendix 1:**

The information collected from ERRC media monitoring concerning instances of hate speech and hate crimes against Romani individuals during 2016 and 2017 is outlined below. This however, does not represent an ex-

27 National Consultative Commission for Human rights, report on fighting against racism, anti-Semitism and xenophobia, 2016, p.18.



haustive list of instances of hate crime and hate speech against Romani migrants in France. It only describes the most significant, recent cases depicting the continuity and the amplitude of the phenomenon of Antigypsyism:

In 2017 a number of instances of hate crime and hate speech were recorded:

- 1 On 27 January, Marine Le Pen, chairwoman of the Front National and member of the European Parliament, pointed Roma population for the alleged insecurity in Denain. In a press conference Le Pen claimed there is a “security problem<sup>28</sup>” in Denain “because there are 1,000 Roma over the city”.<sup>29</sup> The ERRC is currently pursuing a criminal complaint about this incident.
- 2 On the night of 7 March a car parked near a Romani community in Hellemmes was destroyed with a Molotov cocktail. A few weeks before this incident a caravan was subjected to an arson attack “just after a quarrel occurred between Romani families and some young non-Roma young coming ‘to play’” in the Romani community.<sup>30</sup>
- 3 On 27 February Franck Sinisi, a local official from the Front National in Fontaine municipality had made a speech against Roma during a formal session of the City Council. He suggested to “remove Roma’s gold teeth”, to provide “self-funding” of their accommodation in Fontaine.<sup>31</sup>
- 4 On 30 March 2017 a member of the Gitan community was killed during his arrest in Seur where he lived with his family. He was killed by seven bullets during an operation involving police and special forces. Police sources say the investigation has not ruled out the possibility that the police and elite forces were engaged in some kind of joint training exercise when the incident happened.
- 5 On 8 April 2017 members of the Roma community as well as an Iraqi family accommodated in a church in Roubaix were subjected to a gun attack by “young people from the neighbourhood”.<sup>32</sup> First they threw stones through the church’s doors and injured one person. Later two cars arrived in front of the church and opened fire. The police opened an investigation.
- 6 On 27 April 2017 local officials from the Socialist Party organised a protest blocking the national road N315 near the Roma slum in Gennevilliers calling on State authorities to dismantle the slum. This protest was initiated by the mayor issuing an order to close the road. It seems, the protesters used vehicles provided by the municipality, as reported France Soir.<sup>33</sup>
- 7 On 5 May 2017 a fire broke out in a Roma slum located in Wasquehal. The mayor proposed a forced eviction of the “illegal camp” as response to the accident probably caused by the poor living conditions in the community.<sup>34</sup>
- 8 On the night of 20 to 21 May Romani individuals originating from Kosovo, Albania, and Montenegro, all of them refugees or asylum seekers, living in a camp near the Alpes stadium in Grenoble, were attacked by several motorcyclists armed with baseball bats and sticks;<sup>35</sup> they threatened the Romani families and ordered them to leave the place.
- 9 On 22 May Roma migrants, refugees, and asylum seekers from Kosovo, Albania and Montenegro were subjected to an arson attack in a camp called Valmy in Grenoble.<sup>36</sup> Unknown individuals threw a Molotov

28 France 3, 27 January 2017: <http://france3-regions.francetvinfo.fr/hauts-de-france/nord-pas-calais/nord/denain/securite-denain-marine-pen-met-cause-1000-roms-1184947.html>.

29 Europe 1, 27 January 2017: <http://www.europe1.fr/politique/securite-a-denain-nord-marine-le-pen-met-en-cause-1000-roms-2962583>.

30 La Voix du Nord, 13 March: <http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/131908/article/2017-03-13/la-friche-h2d-est-toujours-un-gruyere-d-ou-les-roms-entrent-et-sortent>.

31 Conseil municipal Fontaine, 27 February: <http://ville-fontaine.fr/vie-municipale/conseils-municipaux>.

32 La Voix du Nord, 8th of April: [http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/145247/article/2017-04-08/une-enquete-apres-des-coups-de-feu-tires-pres-de-l-eglise-saint-paul%23utm\\_medium=redaction&utm\\_source=twitter&utm\\_campaign=page-fan-vdn](http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/145247/article/2017-04-08/une-enquete-apres-des-coups-de-feu-tires-pres-de-l-eglise-saint-paul%23utm_medium=redaction&utm_source=twitter&utm_campaign=page-fan-vdn).

33 See: <http://www.francesoir.fr/societe-faits-divers/gennevilliers-des-elus-de-gauche-bloquent-la-n315-pour-faire-demanteler-un-camp-insalubre-roms-autoroute-a15-paris-asnieres-sur-seine-enfants-non-scolarises-patrick-leclerc-gauche-pcf>.

34 La Voix du Nord, La maire redemande «l’expulsion du camp illégal» de Roms après un incendie, 5 May 2017: <http://www.lavoixdunord.fr/157912/article/2017-05-05/la-maire-redemande-l-expulsion-du-camp-illegal-de-roms-apres-un-incendie>.

35 See: <http://grandgrenoble.alpes1.com/news/locales/18146/grenoble-le-camp-de-valmy-attaqu-de-nuit>.

36 See: <http://www.placegrenet.fr/2017/05/23/agression-de-migrants-incendie-riverains-excedes-tension-monte-autour-camp-valmy/139137>.



cocktail, causing a fire in the camp. In a video<sup>37</sup> published by *France 3*, witnesses claimed a car came to the camp and individuals threw a bottle containing flammable liquid to start a fire in the camp, burning a car. Witnesses suspect members of the far-right movement who held a meeting on 20 May in Saint Martin d'Hères near Grenoble.<sup>38</sup>

In 2016 number of instances of hate speech and hate crimes were recorded:<sup>39</sup>

- 1 On 28th of November Paul-Marie Coûteaux, a former candidate from the far-right party FN Rassemblement Bleu Marine, withdrew his appeal following a guilty verdict for making a speech suggesting that Romani people be “concentrated in camps”, thus making the court judgement definitive.<sup>40</sup>
- 2 Stéphane Ravier, Senator-mayor, published a statement in the newsletter of 13/14 district in Marseille in December describing Romani living areas as “wild camps”<sup>41</sup>.
- 3 Swastikas and racist messages attacking Jewish and Romani people were discovered at the Anne Frank nursery school in an eastern suburb of Paris, Montreuil. In the act of vandalism was carried out over Christmas Eve; slogans including “Juden verboten” (Jews forbidden) and “Sales Juifs et Roms” (Filthy Jewish and Romani people), were found painted on the front gate of the nursery.<sup>42</sup>
- 4 Tension<sup>43</sup> between Roma living in a slum in Marseille and young people living in the same neighbourhood led to a violent attack against the inhabitants of the slum the night of 15 to 16 August.
- 5 A Romani child was heavily beaten by three men when he tried to get water from a public fountain. This assault on a child revealed what the media called “a tense climate” in Marseille.<sup>44</sup>
- 6 A Roma slum was targeted by gunfire in the night from Saturday to Sunday, reported by “InfosH24”.<sup>45</sup>
- 7 On Tuesday 14 June, in Lille, English football supporters humiliated Romani children by throwing coins and bottles at them. No measures have been taken by the authorities to condemn this act of humiliation.<sup>46</sup>
- 8 JP Lecoq, mayor of the 6th district of Paris, made an offensive speech published in the official newsletter of the district: “Most of the Roma belong to mafia networks which do not hesitate to exploit the weakest (the most vulnerable) of them, reducing them to a sort of modern-day slavery”<sup>47</sup>

Information concerning previous years is available at:

- Census of forced evictions in living areas occupied by Roma (or persons designed as such) in France (2015), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-census-of-forced-evictions-in-living-areas-occupied-by-roma-2015.pdf>.
- Census: Forced evictions of migrant Roma in France, ERRC (2014), available at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/france-detailed-report-14-january-2014.pdf>.

37 France 3, Nouvelle tentative d'intimidation des migrants installés au camp de Valmy à Grenoble, 23 May: <http://france3-regions.francetvinfo.fr/auvergne-rhone-alpes/isere/grenoble/nouvelle-tentative-intimidation-migrants-installes-au-camp-valmy-grenoble-1259331.html>.

38 See: <http://www.medias-presse.info/meeting-de-civitas-a-saint-martin-dheres-choses-vues-et-entendues/74524/>.

39 See the full list at: <http://www.errc.org/cms/upload/file/roma-eviction-census-france-2016.pdf>.

40 See: <http://www.ouest-france.fr/societe/justice/condamne-pour-ses-propos-sur-les-roms-l-ex-candidat-fn-renonce-lappel-4643139>.

41 See La Provence, 13 December 2016: <http://www.laprovence.com/actu/en-direct/4241440/roms-les-associationsrepondent-a-ravier.html>.

42 See: <https://www.rt.com/news/371885-france-anne-frank-school-swastikas/>.

43 Jean-Jacques Fagni, deputy Prosecutor in Marseille said for “FObs”, 17 August 2016.

44 La Provence, Marseille : un enfant rom roué de coups par des voisins ?, 21 July 2016: <http://www.laprovence.com/article/edition-marseille/4043811/un-enfant-rom-roue-de-coups-par-desvoisins.html>, 27 Médiapart, 167.

45 20 Minutes, Montpellier: Un camp rom aurait été la cible de coups de feu, 23 May 2016.

46 See: <http://www.errc.org/article/errc--fare-network-take-further-action-against-racist-england-football-fans/4501>.

47 Edito du maire, notre 6eme, n°292 April 2016, p.3.